This study examines the process of response and revision for students and their instructors in first-year composition. Drawing on extensive scholarship that describes both the importance of response for student growth as writers (Bazerman & Tinberg, 2015; Brooke & Carr, 2015; Downs, 2015; Probst, 1989; Rose, 2015) as well as the potential downfalls and misunderstandings throughout this process (Bardine, Bardine, & Deegan, 2000; Brannon & Knoblauch, 1982; Dohrer, 1991; Sommers, 1982; Straub, 1997; Straub & Lunsford, 1995), I conducted a mixed method study that looks more closely at student and instructor perspectives throughout this process and reveals moments of disconnect, confusion, and frustration that can thwart the positive effects of response. I provide detailed quantitative and qualitative data, focusing primarily on a multiple case study surrounding seven first-year composition students and their instructors. Findings for this study support the claim that the process of response and revision is complex, filled with potential moments of disconnect that stem from differing perspectives, interpretations, experiences, and values. I also argue that the larger context of the composition classroom is critical to the way that instructors and students interpret response.