ART, SOCIABILITY AND URBAN SPACE

A COMPREHENSIVE PROJECT
LA 404

by
JEFF SHIELDS

PROJECT ADVISOR - MALCOLM CAIRNS
COURSE INSTRUCTOR - RONALD L. SPANGLER

BALL STATE UNIVERSITY
MUNCIE, INDIANA
MAY, 1997
ABSTRACT

5TH YEAR COMPREHENSIVE PROJECT:
Art, Sociability and Urban Space

STUDENT: Jeff Shields

DEGREE: Bachelor of Landscape Architecture

COLLEGE: Architecture and Planning

DATE: May, 1997

PAGES: 72

A sense of placelessness within our urban environment is beginning to prevail in America’s cityscape. This is primarily due to a growing lack of character demonstrated in the design of public plazas today. However, art is being used as a placemaking technique to form a connection between the community and the urban environments they utilize. At the focus of most successful urban spaces is some form of art or landscape element, such as a sculpture or fountain, which will create focus within the space. This undertaking focuses on creating identity in an urban environment through the implementation of art as a placemaker, as well as enhancing social space.
DEPARTMENT OF LANDSCAPE
ARCHITECTURE
FINAL REPORT OUTLINE
Spring 1997

Cover Page ........................................... i
Title Page ........................................... ii
Abstract ............................................. iii
Table of Contents .................................... iv
List of Figures ....................................... v
Acknowledgements ................................. vi
Chapter 1: Introduction ............................. 1
Chapter 2: Background or Literature Review ...... 2
Chapter 3: Significance ............................. 8
Chapter 4: Problem Statement ..................... 8
Chapter 5: Hypothesis ............................... 9
Chapter 6: Goals and Objectives .................. 10
Chapter 7: Assumptions ............................ 10
Chapter 8: Limitations ............................. 11
Chapter 9: Client/User ............................. 12
Chapter 10: Programmatic Statement ............. 12
Chapter 11: The Project ........................... 13
  Site Location ..................................... 13
  Inventory or Opportunities & Constraints ...... 14
  Concept 1 ......................................... 29
  Concept 2 ......................................... 30
  Concept 3 ......................................... 31
  Master Plan ....................................... 32
  Details and Perspectives ......................... 32
  Conclusion ...................................... 37
Chapter 10: Bibliography .......................... 38

APPENDIX A ......................................... 40
List of Figures

Figure 1. Close up of Riverwalk .................................. 2
Figure 2. Ariel view of Riverwalk .................................. 2
Figure 3. Overhead of Clinton Square Map ......................... 3
Figure 4. Perspective of Steelmakers ............................... 3
Figure 5. Picture of Steps ............................................. 3
Figure 6. Petting ....................................................... 4
Figure 7. The Helpless Robot ......................................... 5
Figure 8. The Legible City .............................................. 5
Figure 9. The Legible City .............................................. 5
Figure 10. City Market’s Center Hall ............................... 12
Figure 11. The site is located in downtown Indianapolis .......... 13
Figure 12. Interior view of Center Hall ............................. 13
Figure 13. Historic Union Station .................................. 14
Figure 14. The first Indianapolis 500 .............................. 15
Figure 15. Market days during the 1920’s ......................... 15
Figure 16. Tomlinson Hall ............................................. 15
Figure 17. Focus Diagram .............................................. 16
Figure 18. View of Whistler Plaza .................................. 16
Figure 19. Pedestrian flow diagram ................................. 17
Figure 20. View from intersection into Whistler plaza .......... 17
Figure 21. Shade Diagram ............................................. 18
Figure 22. Diagram of views ......................................... 19
Figure 23. View of entrance .......................................... 19
Figure 24. Diagram of planting beds ............................... 20
Figure 25. Planting bed located in Whistler plaza ............... 20
Figure 26. Urban Noise Diagram ................................... 21
Figure 27. View of street to Monument Circle .................... 21
Figure 28. Alley Diagram ............................................. 22
Figure 29. View of market alley .................................... 22
Figure 30. Location of Tomlinson catacombs ..................... 23
Figure 31. Location of Tomlinson facade ......................... 24
Figure 32. View of Tomlinson facade ............................... 24
Figure 33. Location of Historic clock ............................. 25
Figure 34. View of historic clock ................................... 25
Figure 35. Location of existing fountain .......................... 26
Figure 36. View of fountain ......................................... 26
Figure 37. Diagram of parking ....................................... 27
Figure 38. View of parking .......................................... 27
Figure 39. Location of MSA .......................................... 28
Figure 40. View of MSA .............................................. 28
Figure 41. Diagram of concept 1 ................................... 29
Figure 42. Diagram of concept 2 ................................... 30
Figure 43. Diagram of concept 3 ................................... 31
Figure 44. Detail of proposed wall ................................. 32
Figure 45. Detail of proposed light ................................. 32
Figure 46. Master Plan ................................................ 33
Figure 44. Perspective of Entrance ................................. 34
Figure 45. View of interactive sculpture within Whistler Plaza .. 34
Figure 46. Section of catacombs .................................... 35
Figure 47. View of Tomlinson Facade and social space ........ 35
Figure 48. View of proposed booths ............................... 35
Figure 49. Axial of proposed atrium ............................... 36
Figure 50. View of shadow formed by interactive sculpture .... 36
Figure 51. View of proposed alley amenities .................... 36
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the following for their time and consideration in assisting me in the development of this comprehensive project.

Project advisor: Malcolm Cairns
Studio advisor: Ron Spangler
Indianapolis City Market: Jane Schlegel
                       James A. Reilly

Naturally, I want to thank the Class of '97 for the great memories and experiences over the last five years.
Chapter 1: Introduction

A sense of placelessness within our urban environment is beginning to prevail in America's cityscape. This is primarily due to a growing lack of character demonstrated in the design of public plazas today. This lack of identity is further depleted by the use of prefabricated landscape elements, such as generic benches, trash cans and handrails. The use of cheap common place materials, such as concrete and asphalt pavers, also contributes to the growing appearance of comparable urban plazas. However, art is being used as a placemaking technique to form a connection between the community and the urban environments they utilize.

At the focus of most successful urban spaces is some form of art or landscape element, such as a sculpture or fountain, which will create focus within the space. Furthermore, urban environments are extremely interesting because they are very social in context, therefore understanding complex relationships between a user and the design of an urban plaza is especially important. Accordingly, the relationship between art, sociability and urban space is the major focus of this comprehensive project.

This undertaking focuses on creating identity in an urban environment through the implementation of art as a placemaker, as well as enhancing social space. Three concepts have guided the development this project: placemaking, interactive art and sociability. Although these topics can be separated into individual categories they also tend to overlap, creating an essential relationship between these layers within the design process.
Chapter 2: Background or Literature Review

PLACEMAKING

Placemaking is the advocacy for the visual enhancement of the built environment by combining public art and urban design to affirm, enhance and reveal a sense of place (Fleming 7). In essence, the use of art in urban design is an important element in the creation of a sense of place. It provides a unique character which will distinguish the plaza from the surrounding environment and form a bond between the site and community. Placemaking is meant to establish a memorable place in which the visitor will enjoy and revisit at some point in the future. The following is four objectives which can give placemakers an intrinsic role in urban design (Fleming 8):

1. It provides a directional tool by navigating pedestrians through a space.
2. It creates a sense of connection by unifying space through a matrix of meaning.
3. It strengthen identity by serving as an orientation to space.
4. It animates space and encourages specific activities.

The Riverwalk in Memphis, Tennessee is an example of a placemaking technique being used to provide direction and lead pedestrians along the course of the pathway. The riverwalk is a scale model of the lower Mississippi River. It is formed from concrete, slate, stainless steel, bronze and mosaics. The work itself uses these materials to represent the cities, vegetation, streets and the river’s course. The pathway leads people to several courtyards, an amphitheater, a children’s playground, museum, gift shops, recreational areas, restaurants and a wading pond which is a replica of the Gulf of Mexico. It acts to pull people through the space by creating new discoveries for them to explore as they travel along the linear path (Fleming 143 - 145).
The Clinton Square Map creates a sense of connection by unifying space through a matrix of meaning and detail. The map depicts the layout of the city and forms an intimate connection with the community by allowing members of the town to point out locations they are familiar with, such as where they live or work. This provides a more personal relationship between the space and user (Beardsley 35).

Placemakers can also be used to strengthen the identity within a site and serve as an orientation to space. This is a pretty straightforward concept, the work is used as a focal point at a pivotal location within the site. It essentially creates a point of reference for pedestrians. For example, Steelmakers in Youngstown, Ohio provides focus within a pedestrian mall, as well as depicting the local steel industry around which the community was formed (Beardsley 72).

An excellent example of a placemaker being used to animate space by defining an area for a specific activity is located in Seattle, Washington. The work, Dancer’s Series: Steps, is a set of bronze dance steps embedded in concrete near a Seattle bus stop. It actually prompts people to start dancing and interact with one another while they wait for the bus to arrive (Fleming 162).
INTERACTIVE ART

The phrase interactive art describes a work of art, or landscape element, which reacts to the movement of individual users. This interaction could be either a conscious, or unconscious, relationship between the user and the environment in which this interplay occurs. The work becomes interactive when it stimulates the senses of the user through touch, sound, sight, smell or taste.

Interactive art becomes more significant when it is used to enhance the use of social space by providing a source of triangulation. Currently, sound sculptures are the most common type of interactive work which stimulate the senses. For instance, “Talking tubes” are large pipes used to transport someone’s voice or sounds associated with the site from one part of the space to another. Furthermore, interactive art can take on numerous levels of appearance and sophistication due to the types of technologies and materials used in the work. These works range from simple stone spheres used to make a pattern in sand to complex electronic technology used to stimulate the senses of a user. The following are examples of technologically advanced interactive works: Petting, The Helpless Robot and The Legible City.

*Petting* is an interactive work which responds to the touch of a person by emitting a sound. The intensity of the response will depend on the amount of pressure the user applies to the surface of the piece. This work is intended to cause people to think about their relationship with machines, such as cars, computers and guitars (Aafjes).
The helpless robot attempts to enlist the help of pedestrians by asking passersby for assistance in moving around a plaza or open space. For instance, as a pedestrian walks by the robot, it will state politely, "Excuse me... have you got a moment?" It will then ask the person to help move some portion of itself, as this relationship continues the robot becomes more and more demanding, almost dictatorial. The piece is a "free-standing electronically-controlled kinetic sculpture," which is a passive work that must utilize the strength of humans to move instead of any internal power source (Muller).

The legible city is an example of virtual reality and electronic technology being used to create an interactive work. The work is a three dimensional world simulated by a computer model and navigated by riding a bicycle. The computer world is a virtual city formed by the use of words and sentences to define the cities streets and buildings which the user moves through (Shaw).
SOCIABILITY

Sociability is a very important concept when a Landscape Architect approaches the design of an active urban space. The challenge is to shape an aesthetically pleasing space which responds to the needs of the public by creating a comfortable and friendly atmosphere. William H. Whyte defines several aspects of a site which affect the use of an urban space in the film, *The Social Life of Small Urban Spaces*. They are the following:

- Seatable Space
- Street / Space Relationship
- Sunlight
- Water
- Trees
- Food courts
- Triangulation

Seatable space is probably the most important issue of sociability because the majority of plaza users enjoy sitting and relaxing in outdoor spaces. It provides a place where they can get away from the monotony of their work environment. Whyte recommends one linear foot of seatable space per 30 square feet of open space, as well as making the most of ledges and steps as functional seating. Movable seating is the most friendly and used type of seating in a plaza because it allows the individual to create a more comfortable situation for himself or herself. In addition, when movable benches are used in a public environment they should be more than two back sides in width. Significantly, a designer must understand that most people sit near the street side of a plaza and provide an appropriate amount of seats.
A dynamic streetscape is the life's blood of a public urban space because it attracts the majority of passerby into the plaza. In fact, the most active urban plazas have a direct relationship to an active streetscape. Additionally, the corners of intersection are vital components to a busy sidewalk because they create the opportunity for numerous impromptu meetings and discussions. Windows are an important element in helping define how the streetscape is perceived, it enhances the use and activity of an area by forming a friendly and welcome atmosphere.

The presence or absence of sunlight has a tremendous effect on the use of a space, especially if the space is usually cold and shady. However, bounce light is a possible design solution to any existing problems.

A water feature is a considerable element within an urban plaza because it provides the sound of moving water to disguise the noise of the metropolitan surroundings, in addition to enhancing the perception of seclusion from the encompassing environment. Furthermore, contact with water forms a more intimate connection between the site and user, allowing them to block out the surrounding environment.

Trees provide a change in microclimate and shade during hot and sunny days, especially when used in groves. In addition, trees create a more natural and comfortable environment while enhancing a perception of seclusion and protection. Moreover, the most used spaces in an urban environment is a small secluded space near an active streetscape.

Food courts are an important element to the life of an urban plaza because they attract people to the space. Most food courts are also very congested and crowded which forces people to meet each other, thereby amplifying the social quality of the plaza.

Triangulation is the relationship between the site, user and any form of entertainment, such as, musicians, mimes or some form of art which people can discuss or interact. After all, the number one activity in an urban space is people watching other people engage in various activities.
Chapter 3: Significance

The growing epidemic of placelessness and loss of identity in the modern urban environment has lead to a bland cityscape throughout the United States and other countries. Unfortunately, this uniform esthetic character is typical of the majority of today’s modern structures and plazas. This project is an attempt to develop an understanding of how Landscape Architects and designers can establish an aptitude to offset these growing trends. Therefore, the creation of ‘genus loci’ or a sense of place is becoming a more important tool in creating and defining a space which will help attract people to nearby businesses. Art, an essential tool of placemaking, is usually the main element involved in creating a space which will enhance the experiences of the general public and instilling a lasting impression in the mind of visitors. In the end, the creation of fond memories of a space will encourage repeat visits, in addition to attracting new patrons.

Chapter 4: Problem Statement

The Indianapolis City Market currently lacks identity and presence in the growing urban environment causing the historic landmark to be lost in the downtown district. The size and bland character of the existing plazas seem to be a major contributing factor to this apparent placelessness. Additionally, these plazas do not respond to the needs of a socially active public space because of a lack of adequate seating, spatial diversity and triangulation. The market’s administration feels it is important to develop more substantial signage to improve public awareness of the site. However, the overall problem is attracting new patrons and visitors to increase the current number of vendors and activities which take place on the site.
Chapter 5: Hypothesis

The understanding of sociability and space is an essential component to the development of a Landscape Architect. Therefore, it is important to study the elements of social space, as well as understand how users interact with each other and the surrounding environment. The study of a small scale design will act as an introduction to the problem of designing with the needs of sociability in mind. Can a Landscape Architect apply an understanding of how people behave in social space to a site specific design?

Furthermore, placemaking is an important element in the creation of a successful space. Therefore, it is important for a Landscape Architect to be able to understand how art or sculpture can be used to enhance the identity of an urban space. In essence, art is a critical component to creating a memorable space and developing a unique site character. Can a Landscape Architect use art to enhance the identity of public urban space and increase the attraction of patrons to a given site?
Chapter 6: Goals and Objectives

The primary goal of the project is to increase the identity of the city market within the Indianapolis downtown environment. This can be accomplished through the incorporation of a number of interactive sculptures and increasing the historic identity of the site. For example, strengthening awareness of historic Tomlinson Hall by providing access and utility of the underground catacombs as a downtown destination.

This primary goal is strengthened by two closely related objectives. Increasing the sociability and interaction within the site by providing a variety of outdoor social spaces. This will allow the visitor to choose the type of environment he or she would like to utilize while at the site, in addition to providing a number of various experiences each time that individual returns to the market.

The combination of these goals will lead to an increase in the number of patrons and visitors to the site, which will in turn allow the market to support a larger number of vendors.

Chapter 7: Assumptions

Several assumptions allow the development of this comprehensive project to move forward quickly and smoothly. First, environmental art is an important and necessary component of a public space and how that space is perceived. Second, placemaking uses sculpture and traditional pieces, as well as landscape elements, such as fountains, seating and details to define the character of the site. In addition, art is interactive through the stimulation of the human senses by integrating texture, color, movement, sound and smell within a work of art. Finally, sociability is related to the overall perception of a space because it is a determining factor in how a space is used by the community.
Another set of assumptions relates to the attitude of the client. First, it is assumed the client is intent on developing a public environment which focuses on the incorporation of original art work to enhance site identity. Additionally, there will not be any liability problems with the development of an interactive sculpture or landscape element. Finally, the materials and technology used to develop an environmental art project will be capable of withstanding the conditions of the outdoor environment.

Chapter 8: Limitations

Currently, several limitations exist which are important considerations to the development of this project. The amount of time, as well as a defined schedule, will determine the refinement of the final design and level of detail. Second, the site will act as a determining factor and restricts the size, type and complexity of the proposed interactive art, as well as any additional placemaking features. Additionally, the history of the site is an important factor when making design decisions and will influence the final outcome of the project. Next, the type of material and technology available will determine the direction and capabilities of the art work and the extent to which it will be interactive. Additionally, the issue of safety will be a very limiting factor in the development of this project due to liability concerns.
Chapter 9: Client/User

The client, Jane Schlegel, is the president of the Indianapolis City Market Commission located in downtown Indianapolis. The administration of the City Market is interested in creating an identity for itself in the downtown district through the implementation of a refined site design and the addition of distinguishing signage. They feel the incorporation of an interactive art work will establish a unique identity in the urban area and promote the revitalization of the exterior landscape, as well as, connect the interior and exterior spaces. The historic City Market is a non-profit corporation that feels it is important to provide an dynamic urban space to attract members of the public.

The users of this proposed project will be the general public and employees from the surrounding businesses and buildings. The space will be a source of relaxation and entertainment for pedestrians, or patrons, during daylight hours. Other uses will be during special events, weekends and evening hours.

Chapter 10: Programmatic Statement

A program has been developed to help define some of the essential features the plaza needs to become a successful open space. The development of this program is based upon the opportunities and constraints of the site (discussed in the next chapter), placemaking, art and sociability. In essence, these ideas help determine the design basis which will be incorporated into the overall master plan. The following elements seem to be fundamental to establishing a flourishing space at the Indianapolis City Market: gateway entrances, food courts, interactive sculpture, water features, open social space, secluded private space, a small stage, streetscape access,
an atrium, kiosk and alley entryways. Additionally, each feature is more thoroughly explained in the master plan section of chapter 11.

Chapter 11: The Project

SITE LOCATION

The City Market is a historic market place that includes a number of distinct retail services in the downtown area. Currently, these services range from a typical fast food restaurant to a more intimate “fruit and vegetable” booths. Center hall is the central structure of the site, as well as being the only remaining historic structure. It acts as a focal point within the site and divides the existing urban plazas. This central building is flanked by two smaller wings that begin to define the surrounding landscape and add a modern character to the market place. The market is located in the downtown district of Indianapolis, a large metropolitan center. Therefore, the site is surrounded by numerous shopping centers and business headquarters, providing a pedestrian rich environment from which users and patrons can be attracted.

The site is surrounded by several notable downtown destinations; such as Union Station, the Circle Center Mall, the RCA Dome and office buildings, along with many other public facilities. This urban marketplace is located across from Market Square Arena and bound by Delaware, Alabama and Market Streets. The context of this site is an ideal environment for the study of public art and social space in an urban atmosphere.
SITE HISTORY / CONTEXT HISTORY

INDIANAPOLIS HISTORY

The “Crossroads of America,” Indianapolis was not initially located in the most advantageous area in Indiana. The capital was located near the center of the state for obvious political reasons, unfortunately, it was placed on the White River which was not navigable. This fact virtually eliminated any potential trade and industry due to the lack of prompt transportation to and from the city.

The city plat was designed by Alexander Ralston, an apprentice of Pierre L’ Enfant, in 1830. The plan used a sensible grid with crossing boulevards to create focus on a central common space, which later became Monument Circle.

Three significant events stimulated the development of Indianapolis and guided economic growth. They were the following (Landscape Architecture Foundation):

1. Railroad lines were routed through the city.
2. Natural gas was discovered near the city.
3. Indianapolis became the second largest producer of automobiles.

In 1847, the railroad lead to rapid commercial and industrial growth because access to the city improved and businesses soon began to move their interest there. In addition, the nation’s first Union Station was constructed in 1854, approximately six blocks from the City Market. By 1861, Indianapolis was one of the country’s major rail centers.

Figure 13. Historic Union Station
In the Mid-1880s, the discovery of gas gave a momentous boost to its economy by attracting additional business and industry. In fact, "the city flaunted its newfound wealth with two flambeaux located on the Circle, shooting gas flames into the air" (33).

In 1913, Indianapolis was the country's second largest automobile producer, in addition to being considered the second greatest traded center in the Midwest, next to Chicago. Moreover, the success of this auto industry lead to the "greatest spectacle in racing", Indianapolis 500, because of the need for a local test track.

CITY MARKET HISTORY

The city market has a very significant history and represents over 100 years of community heritage (Design Arts Grant 2). The city market was included in the 1821 plat map of Indianapolis by Alexander Ralston and remained continuously active. However, in 1886, Tomlinson and Center Hall were constructed to provide several additional amenities. Center Hall was built to provide an indoor market place and stalls for use when weather conditions were poor. While Tomlinson Hall provided gymnasium facilities, a theater, conference space and office space. Unfortunately, Tomlinson Hall burnt down in 1958 and replaced with additional parking space. In addition, the market received another one-story structure to expand the indoor market place in 1906. Overall, the market reached its highest point of success in the 1920's and has been facing a steady decline in prosperity ever since.
INVENTORY / OPPORTUNITIES & CONSTRAINTS

STREET CORNERS

There is a significant opportunity to create focus at the corners of each plaza due to the relatively horizontal character of the site. These are excellent locations for substantial signage to establish a stronger identity for the market. Moreover, these areas are essentially incorporated into the corners of an intersection which is a active social space, attracting patrons into the market.
PEDESTRAIN MOVEMENT

The majority of patrons come from Monument Circle and flow through the plaza to the main hall. It is an important opportunity to maintain this flow and connection to the streetscape.

Figure 19. Pedestrian flow diagram

Figure 20. View from intersection into Whistler plaza
SHADOW PATTERNS

Shadow patterns are a major constraint during the winter because the entire site is covered by shade, decreasing the temperature on the site. However, the effect is less significant during the summer because it only affects the southern edge or sidewalk of the space.

Figure 21. Shade Diagram
PROMINANT VIEWS

The quality of views can attract and interest patrons, as well as guide patrons to and from important areas of the site. Views into an active plaza will attract more people and enhance the use of site.

Figure 22. Diagram of views

Figure 23. View of entrance
PLANTING BEDS

Planting beds offer both constraints, by visually and physically separating the plaza from the streetscape; and opportunities, by providing potential informal seating and essential greenscape.

Figure 24. Diagram of planting beds

Figure 25. Planting bed located in Whistler plaza
URBAN NOISE

The majority of urban noise is produced by the automobile and streetscape which bind the site. This noise probably has the most impact on the site during rush hours.

Figure 26. Urban Noise Diagram

Figure 27. View of street to Monument Circle
PEDESTRAIN ALLEY

The pedestrian alley offers an excellent opportunity to tap into the pedestrian flow to and from work. Workers travel from parking lots located on the northeast side of the site to office buildings and downtown destinations on the northwest. This situation provides an outstanding possibility of enhancing awareness of the City Market.

Figure 28. Alley Diagram

Figure 29. View of market alley
TOMLINSON CATACOMBS

The catacombs enhance the potential historic identity of the site and expand services and hours. This feature will increase attraction due the unique character of the catacombs, it is currently dark and enclosed, providing an intimate atmosphere.

Figure 30. Location of Tomlinson catacombs
TOMLINSON FACADE

Once again, the Tomlinson Facade offers the potential increase the historic identity of the hall, along with the implied ability to act as an entrance to the catacombs. This facade could be move to improve its presence but it seems to be the original location of the facade within the structure of the building.

Figure 31. Location of Tomlinson facade

Figure 32. View of Tomlinson facade
HISTORIC CLOCK

The clock is an interesting historic element which will remain on the site. This clock was relocated to the city market site.

Figure 33. Location of Historic clock

Figure 34. View of historic clock
EXISTING FOUNTAIN

The existing fountain is an ineffective use of space which limits the potential uses of available space. The fountain has never worked properly due to a constant leak and water being sprayed on the building during windy days.

Figure 35. Location of existing fountain

Figure 36. View of fountain
EXISTING PARKING

The existing parking presents a significant problem to the site because it divides the plaza from the corner intersection. In addition, the majority of people parking here probably do not go to the city market instead they wonder to nearby buildings, such as the city county building.

Figure 37. Diagram of parking

Figure 38. View of parking
MARKET SQUARE ARENA

The size of the arena has a negative impact on the site because it seems to over power the nearby plaza. There is a tremendous possibility the number of patrons will increase when MSA is replaced by an office building or apartments.

Figure 39. Location of MSA

Figure 40. View of MSA
CONCEPTUAL DESIGN OPTIONS

CONCEPT 1

The first concept is a minimalist approach to solving the problem. It focuses on adding a few essential elements which will heighten the sense of identity while allowing the majority of the site character to remain. This can be accomplished by establishing an identifiable entrance, strengthen historic character through artwork and using a central element in each plaza to create focus. The plaza entry will establish historic identity by moving the Tomlinson facade to be incorporated into the proposed entrance signage. Furthermore, artwork would be used depict historic characteristics of the site and create focus within each plaza. The main piece of art will be utilized as the primary entrance to the Tomlinson catacombs. Sociability of the site will be increased by rearranging existing elements, such as benches, trash can and lights, to define spaces.

Figure 41. Diagram of concept 1
CONCEPT 2

Concept two is an attempt to produce a solution through modifying the existing features of the site. Artwork will be the driving force behind this design because it will define space, guide pedestrians, unify the site and form major elements, such as signage and seating. This art work would also pierce the structures on the site to create a connection between the interior and exterior spaces, along with encompass details from within Center Hall. However, the Tomlinson facade will become the main entrance to the catacombs, essentially creating a historic connection between the two elements. Additionally, sociability can be improved by adjusting the width and height of ledges and planting beds, to improve seatable space and connection to the streetscape. Furthermore, sociability issues would determine how art would define given spaces and their function.
CONCEPT 3

Finally, concept three is a blank platte approach to the design in which all existing features of the site is ignored or removes portion of the site, such as parking, planting beds and fountain. This concept uses the interactive art on the corners of the plazas as opposed to a central location. This will allow pedestrian to interact with the work as they pass under the piece into the plaza. These interactive works will be incorporated into a reflection of the historic facades, encompassing the main plazas. Additionally, the main plaza will be further enclosed by atriums to extend the use of these spaces throughout the year and at night. These enclosures are made to allow the reintroduction of a weekend market.

Figure 43. Diagram of concept 3
MASTER PLAN / DETAILS AND PERSPECTIVES

Overall, the main focus of the design is to strengthen the site’s historic identity and sense of place by providing a more complete representation of its past character, such as existing buildings and market activities. In addition, the plan creates a conceptual connection to the city by using representative components to link the site to important historic events which helped establish the success of Indianapolis. This is accomplished through the development of interactive art and architectural elements as the main thrust or unifying factor with the entire site.

Because the site is divided into three separate spaces, a reflection of the city’s grid was used to create a unifying element within the ground plain of the design. In addition, interior details and materials are extended to the outdoor environment to create a connection between the interior and exterior spaces to further unify the site. Both plazas are enclosed by supplementary facades which reflect the historic structures that once existed on the site. Furthermore, a “railroad line” is used to link the main entrance of each plaza by guiding pedestrians to Center Hall. The alley has been incorporated into the design to attract and stimulate the pedestrian’s awareness of the City Market going to and from work.
Figure 43. Master Plan
Whistler plaza is located in the southwest corner of the site and will be enclosed by the addition of a one-story facade which is reminiscent of Tomlinson Hall. This wall forms a sense of mystery by controlling views into the plaza, as well as activities which are taking place within the site. Planting beds now provide street side seating and better views into the site due to a reduction in overall size, in addition to providing essential greenscape to the urban environment.

A symbolic industrial tower is used to act as a beacon and increase attraction to the market because it is incorporated into the main entrance of Whistler plaza. This entrance allows a continual flow of pedestrians and functions as a predetermined meeting place. An interactive sculpture is used as source of triangulation within the plaza in addition to drawing passersby into the space. This sculpture is representative of a steam engine and allows user to control several symbolic functions; such as steam, sound and movement to create a perceived rate of speed. In addition, the sculpture is incorporated into the walkway leading to Center Hall to strengthen the perception of a "railroad line."
The sculpture forms a main entrance to the catacombs bar and grill while providing a focal point within the plaza. Furthermore, a water feature which encompasses the work provides white noise and maximizes the experience when descending to the entrance to the catacombs. Upon entering the catacombs, a small waiting area is formed under the waterfall at which patrons wait before being seated. The restaurant will remain fairly dark to maintain the concealed and intimate atmosphere.

The existing Tomlinson facade acts as an exit to the restaurant, along with defining a small private space and stage, to be used during events and activities. The existing facade is incorporated into a new wall which connects it to the main entrance. This wall enhances the social atmosphere of the streetscape by forming the illusion of a building’s windows. In addition, this secluded private space is an example of an attempt to diversify the plaza spaces. Several awnings are used along this facade to mirror their prominent use in the past history of the market place.

Along the perimeter of center hall booths are used to epitomize the ambience of the site on market days during the 1920’s. These stalls will reflect the interior functions of Center Hall, as well as provide temporary vending booths or additional seating for the food court. A overhead canopy, similar to the material and form of historic booths, will define the area for each cubicle.
The small plaza, southeast corner of the site, has been expanded by eliminating the parking lot and existing fountain. The removal of the parking lot provides a larger space as well as reconnects the corner to the majority of the site. This plaza has been enclosed by an atrium to allow supplementary outdoor use throughout the season and at nights. The facade of this structure is reflective of the historic one-story structure which previously existed on the site and incorporates a water tower as an entrance statement. The framework will include entrances which allow the space to be opened or closed to take advantage of current weather conditions.

The majority of the interior space has remained open to allow flexible use of space during events and activities. Furthermore, the interior of the atrium space is an open grassy green used to reflect the public common previously provided by the court house across market street. An interactive work is incorporated into the skylight and creates shadow patterns within the green when activated.

The alley is used to increase awareness of pedestrians through the use of an interactive kiosk and information plates or panels inset within the walkway. The kiosk is intended to strengthen the relationship between the Indianapolis community and the market by providing historic information about the site and surrounding context. In addition, planting beds have been used to provide seating and green space, as well as having additional signage to pronounce the pedestrians arrival to the city market.
CONCLUSION

Art is a beneficial tool to offset the growing trend of placelessness and lack of identity within our urban environment by using a work of art to create a unique sense of character or place. Furthermore, placemaking creates an intimate connection with the community by strengthen the character, identity and relationship to a site, in essence, differentiating the site from the surrounding environment.

The use of interactive art, architectural features and landscape elements to enhance the identity of the site is essential but an urban space must respond to an active social environment. Furthermore, a successful space uses the elements of sociability and art to provide a number of diverse spaces within a site by incorporating features which strengthen the usability of the space.

Overall, the use of art as a placemaker is an important element in establishing a sense of place within a community. However, if the elements which enhance the sociability of a space are not considered the space may be less effective then intended. In the end, it is the designer who is responsible for providing a social, active space that is memorable and easily identified by the community.
Chapter 12: Bibliography

Texts


Periodicals


**Films**


**Internet Resources**


**Booklets**

APPENDIX A: POWERPOINT PRESENTATION
Art, Sociability and Urban Space: Indianapolis City Market

Ball State University
Jeff Shields

Comprehensive Project

- The project focuses on creating identity in an urban environment through the implementation of art as a placemaker, as well as enhancing social space.
- Three concepts have guided the development of this project: placemaking, interactive art and sociability.
- Although these topics can be separated into individual categories, they also tend to overlap, creating an essential relationship between these layers within the design process.
Placemaking

- Placemaking is the advocacy for the visual enhancement of the built environment by combining public art and urban design to affirm, enhance and reveal a sense of place.
- There are four objectives which can give placemakers a role in urban design.

- Placemaking can be used to provide direction and lead pedestrians.
- The Riverwalk in Memphis, Tennessee is an example of this because the user makes new discoveries as they travel along a linear path.
Placemaking

- can be used to create a sense of connection by unifying space through a matrix of meaning and detail
- as seen in the Clinton Square Map, which depicts the layout of the city and forms an intimate connection with the community

Placemaking

- can be used to strengthen the identity with a site and serves as an orientation to space
- For example, Steelmakers in Youngstown, Ohio provides focus within a space and depicts the community
Placemaking

- can be used to animate space by defining an area for a specific activity
- an example of this is seen at a Seattle bus stop, where bronze dance steps are embedded

Interactive Art

- the phrase interactive art describe a work of art, or landscape element, which reacts to the movement of individual users. This interaction could be either a conscious, or unconscious, relationship between the user and the environment in which this interplay occurs. The work becomes interactive when it stimulates the senses of the user through touch, sound, sight, smell or taste.
Interactive Art

- *Petting* is an interactive work which makes a sound when touched by someone

Interactive Art

- *The helpless robot* attempts to enlist the help of pedestrians to help it move by asking passersby for assistance
Interactive Art

- *The legible city*
  is an example of virtual reality and electronic technology being used to create an interactive work

What makes a successful social space

1. SETTABLE SPACE
   - make ledges and steps functional as seating
   - movable seating is most friendly and usable
   - most people sit near the street side of a plaza

2. STREET
   - windows are important to how the streetscape is perceived
   - most active urban plazas have a direct relationship to a active streetscape
   - street corner are important areas for impromptu conferences and chance meetings

3. SUN
   - warmth of sunlight is most important during cold or chilly weather
   - the presence or absence of light has a tremendous effect on the use of a space
   - bounce light is a possible design solution to existing problems
What makes a successful social space

4. WATER
   - water within urban space promotes the perception of seclusion
   - the sound of moving water disguises the noise of the urban environment
   - contact with pools of water creates a more intimate connection between the site and user, allowing them to block out the surrounding environment.

5. TREES
   - trees provide microclimate and shade during hot and sunny days, especially groves
   - trees create a more natural and comfortable environment
   - trees create a perception of seclusion and protection

What makes a successful social space

6. FOOD
   - food courts are important the life of an urban plaza because they attract people and force people to meet each other

7. TRIANGULATION
   - the relationship between the site, user and any form of entertainment, such as, musicians, mimes or art
Site Location and Context

- The City Market is located in downtown Indianapolis.
- The site is included in the historic downtown.
- Part of the original 1821 plat.

Indianapolis: History

Three important events in the development of Indianapolis:
- In 1847, the railroad lead to rapid commercial and industrial growth.
- Mid-1880s, gas boosted its economy.
- In 1913, Indianapolis was the country’s second largest automobile producer.
City Market: History

- The city market was included in the 1821 plat map of Indianapolis by Alexander Ralston.
- Tomlinson Hall and Center Hall was built in 1886.
- 1906, addition of one story buildings
- Reached its highest point in the 1920's
- Tomlinson Hall was burnt down in 1958

City Market: Present

- Center Hall is only historic structure, flanked by modern wings.
- The market has a rich architectural character, lights and steel work.
Problem Statement

The Indianapolis City Market currently lacks identity and presence in the growing urban environment. In addition, the market feels it is important to develop more substantial signage. However, the overall problem is to attract new patrons and visitors.

Goals

- To increase the identity of the city market
- To increase the number of patrons
- To increase sociability and interaction within the site
- To increase the variety of outdoor social spaces
- To provide access and utility of underground catacombs
Opportunities and Constraints:
Possible Focus

- opportunity to create focus at corners of block
- excellent location for signage
- located near corners of intersection which is a active social space

Opportunities and Constraints:
Pedestrian Movement

- Majority of patrons come from the circle
- Main flow is through the plaza
- maintaining this flow and connection to streetscape is important
Opportunities and Constraints: Shadow Patterns

- During winter the entire site is covered which decrease the temperature on the site.
- During summer only the southern edge is affected.

Opportunities and Constraints: Prominent Views

- The quality of views can attract and interest patrons.
- Views can be used to guide patrons.
- Views of plaza activity attract more people.
Opportunities and Constraints: Planting Beds

- Separate the plaza from the streetscape
- Potential for informal seating
- Provide essential greenscape

Opportunities and Constraints: Urban Noise

- Majority of noise is produced by the automobile and streetscape
Opportunities and Constraints: Pedestrian Alley

- Opportunity to tap into pedestrian flow; to and from work
- Possibility of enhancing awareness of market

Opportunities and Constraints: Tomlinson Catacombs

- potential to increase historic identity
- expand services and hours
- increase attraction due unique character
- it is currently dark and enclosed
Opportunities and Constraints:
Tomlinson Facade

- potential to increase the historic identity of the site
- possible entrance to the catacombs
- this seems to be the original location of the facade within the building

Opportunities and Constraints:
Historic Clock

- Clock was relocated to city market site
- interesting historic element
- Should remain on the site
Opportunities and Constraints: Existing Fountain

- Fountain limits the potential uses of available space
- An ineffective use of space

Opportunities and Constraints: Existing Parking

- Divides corner from plaza
- Effects the use of social space
- Majority of people parking here probably do not go to the city market
Opportunities and Constraints: Market Square Arena

- Size of the arena has a negative impact
- Potential for additional patrons when MSA is replaced by an office building or apartments

Program

- Placemaking and interactive art
- Entrance / Plaza signage
- Water feature
- Food court
- Entrance and development of catacombs
- Define and diversify spaces in plaza: open, active, private, secluded, streetscape
Concept: One

- Minimal touch
- Art work: abstract history, entrance to catacomb, water feature
- Rearrange benches, etc.
- Move existing facade; include in signage

Concept: Two

- Modification
- Artwork: includes signage, pedestrians pass through or under sculpture, pierces facades and structures (connect interior and exterior), acts as guide
- Facade define entrance to catacombs
Concept: Three

- Blank Platte
- Art work: interactive on corner
- Reflection of historic facade or structure
- Possible Atrium space
- Weekend market

Master Plan

- Overall, the design uses a historic theme to form a unique identity and sense of place.
- Because the site is divided into three separate spaces a reflection of the city grid was used to create a unifying element within the design.

- In addition, interior details and materials are extended to the outdoor environment to create a connection between the indoor and outdoor spaces and further unify the site.
- The main plazas are enclosed by walls which reflect the historic structures which once existed on the site.

- A "railroad line" is used to link the main entrances of each plaza and guide pedestrians to Center Hall.
- the wall which encloses the plaza is a reflection of Tomlinson Hall
- it forms a sense of mystery by controlling views into the plaza and activities which are taking place
- incorporates planting beds which also provide street side seating

- incorporates a symbolic industrial tower to act as a beacon and increase attraction
- entrance allows flow of pedestrians and functions as a meeting space
- incorporates a symbolic industrial tower to act as a beacon and increase attraction

- entrance allows flow of pedestrians and functions as a meeting space

- interactive sculpture is used as source of triangulation
- the sculpture is representative of a steam engine and allows user to control several symbolic functions; such as steam, sounds, and perceived rate of speed
- water provides white noise and maximizes the experience of entering the catacombs
• the sculpture incorporates a main entrance to the catacombs bar and grill
• a small waiting area is formed under the waterfall before being seating
• the restaurant will remain fairly dark to maintain the concealed and intimate atmosphere

• an example of diversifying social space which creates an enclosed space for passive use

• the existing facade is incorporated into the new wall and is connected to the main entrance
- representative of the historic booths used on market days
- reflective of interior functions
- can be used for both market booths and food court seating

- plaza has been enclosed to allow outdoor use during the winter and nights.

- facade is reflective of historic structure and incorporates a water tower as an entrance statement.
• majority of space has remained open to allow flexible use of space for events and activities

• interactive art is the creation of shadow patterns

• increase awareness of pedestrians through use of interactive kiosk and information plates and panels

• intended to strengthen the relationship between users and the historic site by providing historic information.
Questions

At this time the floor is open to Questions.