Kublai Khan: The Civilized Barbarian

An Honors Thesis (ID 499)

by

Paul Brian Holleman

Dr. Daniel Goffman

Ball State University
Muncie, Indiana

5 120188

2ss, 1988
Contents

1. Introduction........................................... 3
2. About Spelling and Language......................... 4
3. The Pre-Yuan Mongol Society........................ 5
4. Mothers and Mentors.................................. 11
5. Pre-Yuan China......................................... 15
6. Kublai Khan's Yuan Dynasty.......................... 19
7. Conclusion............................................... 22
   Endnotes............................................... 24
   Bibliography........................................... 26
Introduction

In 1260, in Mongolia and China, a rather obscure Mongol by the name of Shih-Tsu, came to power as the supreme khan of the Mongols, and the Emperor of China. This man, Kublai Khan, consolidated Mongol power in China, created one of the greatest empires in history, and in some ways seemed to be civilized though he was from a society that has been called barbaric. His life and actions have been chronicled by many historians, and his empire immortalized by Samuel Taylor Coleridge. But how, and why, did this take place. Was this nomadic barbarian really civilized? Or was he just a clever, Machiavellian, politician? He was indeed a civilized man, educated at a young age by his Christian mother, and a Buddhist/Confucianist mentor. Cultural aspects of his society also played a role in his ascendancy to the leadership of China and his civilized nature.
About Spelling and Language

Spellings of Mongolian proper names have varied over the years. Some of the first accounts of the Mongols list spellings such as Qubilai, Jhengiz, Cambuluc (Khanbalik), and Cianadu (Xanadu or Shang-Tu). I have tried to use the most modern spellings, most of which reflect the proper pronunciations of those names.
The Pre-Yuan Mongol Society

Kublai Khan broke the norms of Mongol behavior when he came to power in 1260. He seemed to have a streak of civility that his predecessors lacked. But, to explain his apparent civility, it is necessary to look at his background as a Mongol and how it merged with Chinese society.

Prior to 1260, Mongol society was nomadic. The Mongols were primarily hunters and gatherers of the inner Asian steppes, although some did farm and domesticate animals. The hunters followed the antelope and hart herds, while the farmers planted vegetables and raised sheep and horses. However, the two had a symbiotic relationship. The nomadic hunters depended on the farmers for food, horses, and other domestic items, and the farmers relied on the hunters for commodities and protection.

The Mongols were only one of many groups that existed on the steppes, however. The nomads of these tribes hunted and traded along the Frontier Zone, the borders of China and the Western tribes. Hunting and trading were more profitable than farming. These tribes became dependent on each other for trade and thus maintained open, friendly ties. These people of the steppes included the Mongols, the Naimans, the Paliyans, and the Uighars.

Most of these tribes could trace their patrilineal lines back to common ancestors whom they worshipped. Leadership of the tribes and clans was based upon the hierarchy of the family.
The oldest father in the patrilineal line was the ruler of the clan, somewhat like the Roman *pater familias*. Upon his death, however, the succession went to the youngest son of his eldest wife. The Mongols were polygamous. But polygamy was more evident and widely practiced after the raids of Ghengiz began. The youngest son was chosen because he would be able to reign longer than the oldest. There also would not be as much fighting between the son and his uncles because they too would be too old. It was important to avoid conflict over rulership if they were to have a stable system. This family organization and inheritance practice became very important in the rise of the Mongol military state: Ghengiz' 'government' and successors were all family. A family member as heir would ensure continual superiority in conquest, and would carry on the goals of the kaghan.

The common marriage practice for the Mongols was the 'levirate', a dowry system. The bride's family would give a small amount of money and the bride's possessions to the groom's family. Once the two were married, the bride was considered part of the groom's family. If the husband died the wife would still be part of the husband's family, and she would not go back to her own. She would continue to guide her children through their lives.

The Mongols were not restricted from inter-tribal marriages. In fact, it was quite common for tribes to inter-marry. It helped keep the tribes allied with each other, and in good relations.
There was apparently no real system of government, or bureaucracy in the Mongol society. Each family had its own 'ruler' and hierarchy. There was no basic administration that controlled and regulated the people. Likewise, there were no administrative laws. The laws that did exist were societal, and usually pertained to family problems. It was not until Ghengiz Khan that the Mongols began to structure their system in a bureaucratic manner. Under Ghengiz, the Mongols formed a military hierarchy that operated on the advice of a council. This small council was known as the 'kuriltai'. It was necessary to set up this system so that Ghengiz' rule would be stable. Changes in trade and tribal relations due to Ghengiz' conquests, and the need for stabilization and legitimacy in that system, made it necessary to rule with a governmental hierarchy.

At the top of the hierarchy was Ghengiz as kaghan, the supreme leader, or Khan. Below him were field generals that he appointed to different locations around the Asian world. There, they would regulate the provinces that they conquered. Below the field generals were a host of lieutenants and 'enlisted' men, the majority of whom were expertly trained archers. Most Mongol men were in the army. The settled, domestic Mongols stayed near the capital of Karakhorum with their families. While the kaghan conducted and ruled the massive army, the kuriltai conducted public affairs. These public affairs included taxes, laws the Khan might hand down, trade and commerce.
One interesting practice of the military was that none of the soldiers were paid for their services. Even the officers and high generals were not compensated. Yet, they remained fiercely loyal to their commanders. The Khan was seen as the supreme benefactor. He provided food, clothes, and shelter for all his men and their families. This system was based on the tradition that the nomadic leaders handled all the affairs of the hunting and trading parties. The kaghan was also a father figure who took care of all the needs of his family. In this case, the family was his troops. This tradition would explain the allegiance to the khan, because to stray from the khan was to go hungry, naked, and exposed to the elements. Retreat or cowardice was punishable by death. A good Mongol soldier supported the Khan and the cause. Marco Polo emphasizes the point of the supreme benefactor when he explains how Kublai Khan would give every single soldier a new robe at each monthly feast. Marco tells us that Kublai did this to demonstrate his role as supreme commander, in the tradition of all kaghans.

The military had control over all aspects of Mongol society. Even in peacetime, the Mongols were under military orders. Under Ghengiz, and his successors (Tolui, Ogedai, Guyuk, and Mangu), the Mongols were constantly waging wars against neighboring tribes for booty, and glory. For the soldiers it was booty to pay for their services, and for the khan it was the glory of conquest. It was a chaotic era for the Mongols, even though it was also glorious and triumphant. The Mongol
conquerors left their subjugated states in shambles.³

Ghengiz Khan’s rise to power not only changed the ruling structure of Mongol society but also affected marriage practices. Conquest usually led to booty, and for the Mongols one item of particular interest was a war-bride. The Mongols began to take women from the tribes they conquered and make them their wives. Some Mongols, mostly field generals, collected quite a harem. After 1210, the levirate was only found in the settled areas, and sometimes not even there. The surrounding tribes would have found no profit in giving their daughters to the Mongols. The Mongols, in their quest for superiority would take what they wanted anyway.⁴ The war-bride system helped to legitimize their claims at a tribal level. Once Ghengiz had conquered the Naiman tribe in 1206 and taken daughters of the Naiman ruler, the ruler pledged allegiance to the Khan and promised support.⁵

As time went on, inheritance seemed to rest not just on the youngest son of the eldest wife anymore. The khans became more and more concerned with competence and stabilization. They needed a competent man who could consolidate, stabilize and organize the Mongol Empire. However, the eldest wife still retained much power after her husband’s death. Also, the next ruler was still selected from her sons. Between 1206 and 1241, a rift developed between Ghengiz’s two sons: Tolui (Kublai’s father), and Ogedai. The Kaghanship went to Tolui originally, but he abdicated feeling that Ogedai was better for the job. Perhaps he was overwhelmed by the obligations and
responsibilities created by Ghengiz' conquests. Guyuk, one of Ogedai's sons, succeeded Ogedai with no contest from the House of Tolui. But, after Guyuk's death, Tolui's family felt their original claim should be honored. Mangu Khan, youngest son of Tolui and Sorghaqtani, took the reins of leadership. The House of Ogedai had no real objections to Mangu since they had taught him most of his skills anyway. But, the critical point came when Mangu died in 1259. Sorghaqtani supported Kublai, rather than her youngest son Arik-Buke. Sorghaqtani had become close to Kublai as she taught him her beliefs during his childhood. The youngest son practice was no longer a standard, so Arik-Buke could not claim that over Kublai. The original rights had been with Tolui, and since Sorghaqtani was Tolui's eldest wife, she seemed to have control. Even though Tolui had not reigned long and the House of Ogedai had been in control, Sorghaqtani had great influence. Not only was she the mother of Mangu, and the husband of Tolui, but she was also the principal Naiman pawn piece, captured by Ghengiz and the symbol of loyalty from the Naimans. Her voice was heard, and she was able to sway the Kuriltai. Because of this control, she was very influential in Kublai's ascendancy. Sorghaqtani also was influential in another way, by teaching him the ways of her religion.
Mothers and Mentors

Kublai's mother, Sorghaqtani, had been the daughter of a Naiman ruler. The Naiman tribe, was Nestorian, a sect of Asian Christianity. The close relationship they built while he was maturing enabled her to teach him Nestorian beliefs. Perhaps she saw in him the qualities of Nestorianism that would make him a great leader. It is believed by many historians that she helped enlighten her son on Christianity, which is evident in Kublai's actions after his ascent to the kaghanship in 1260. These teachings include religious tolerance and social charity, which Kublai demonstrated during his reign.

The Nestorian church originated out of East Syria as an offshoot of the Byzantine Orthodox church, which itself was deeply rooted in Western Christian ideals. The Nestorians brought these ideals taught by Jesus Christ, and notions of the trinity, to the Orient through the Middle East. For the Mongols of Ghengiz' time, the Nestorians were the key to keeping the Muslims from completely taking over the Middle East, though some converted to Islam. For Kublai Khan, the Nestorian church was a positive influence in foreign relations. The Nestorians were trapped between two religions, and two cultures. On one side were the Muslims who thought of the Nestorians as infidels. On the other side were the Buddhists with their seemingly supernatural ideals. They had to be tolerant of the Muslims to exist, for the Muslims were a much larger group. But, the
Nestorians were also tolerant by nature, since they were an offshoot of the Byzantine form of Christianity that promoted open relations with other religions.

Buddhism had gradually worked its way into the Asian scene and was becoming a prominent religion in China during the 1100s and early 1200s. This religion consisted of the teachings of the man-god Buddha who preached neutrality in life by way of the eight paths. The eight paths included right-mindedness, right knowledge, right truth, and right care and concern. Buddhism also preached unity, a key factor in the simultaneous emergence of Confucianism. Buddhism and Confucianism were able to link because of their similar interests in unity, harmony, and neutrality. Buddhism was also able to accept Christianity since it was as much a philosophy as a religion. This philosophy was able to assimilate other gods and religious ideas.

As a young man, Kublai was guided by a Buddhist/Confucianist mentor, Yao Chi, who taught him the importance of neutrality, patience, and tolerance. It is evident from Kublai's actions during his reign that he did hold to these philosophies. Kublai often asked for aid from Muslims when he didn't trust Christian advice, and used Christian help against the Muslims. He balanced the two and played the neutral mediator. In fact, Kublai was "at all times performing a skillful juggling act with the four principle religions" of Buddhism, Christianity, Islam, and Judaism. The fact that Kublai was trained in Buddhist and Confucianist neutrality by Yao Chi, helps to explain why Kublai
took such an interest in the welfare of his people and accepted foreigners in his realm. It also helps explain why the people of China accepted Kublai. Most Mongols professed Buddhism, but did not have the extensive training that Kublai Khan did, since they were more concerned with conquest and waging wars.12

The Nestorians and the Buddhists during this time period seemed to ally.13 The Nestorians found the intimidation of the Muslims increasing, so they turned to the Buddhists. The Buddhists, able to envelop other religions, accepted them. The Buddhists also considered the Muslims enemies for two major reasons: the Muslims were slowly seeping into the Chinese culture trying to convert everyone; and the Muslims considered the Buddhists infidels and treated them as such. Also, the Tibetan priests were beginning to promote Neo-Confucianism, which was being accepted by the Mongols in conjunction with Nestorianism. It seemed natural that the two should work together.

Kublai Khan combined his knowledge of Nestorian Christianity and Buddhism to strengthen his leadership. The two religions complemented each other: social awareness in Nestorianism, neutralism in Buddhism; tolerance and patience in both. Under Kublai Khan, the poor of China were provided for. Sometimes they were fed from Kublai's own personal granaries.14

Kublai set up many social welfare programs such as government land acts, and agricultural reforms that helped the peasants economically, and helped them forget the tyranny of the Sung.15 He created tax laws that helped the people by restricting
taxation in desperate times. He also tried to unite all sects in China, both religious and political, into a balanced whole that could function effectively, and struggled to create a sense of harmony for the people of China who so desperately needed it.

Some might question whether Kublai's actions were truly acts of kindness and love for his subjects or simply Machiavellian tactics. Kublai was a Mongol raised in the nomadic tradition, knowing full well that the Mongol goals were superiority through conquest, not politics. It must be understood, however, that Kublai did not simply attend a seminar on the politics of religion. He spent his whole childhood and early manhood rigorously learning the beliefs and teachings of his mother and his mentor, who were both strongly dedicated to their faiths. Nestorianism and Buddhism/Confucianism were not merely policies, but were complete religions within themselves, both complementing each other in Kublai's education and helping him realize that he did not have to be a barbarian to be a great Mongol leader. Through these teachings he could create effective policies to help revive a stricken society and culture: China.
Pre-Yuan China

For thousands of years China had existed within a cyclical history. Each cycle contained three periods. The first period consisted of reform and progress with the coming of a new dynasty; the second established that particular dynasty and stabilized conditions within the already existing administration; and the third period ended the cycle in decay, rebellion, and need for change. Then a new dynasty would rise to abolish the old. But through the whole process, from one dynasty to another, the government and administration always stayed the same; an empire controlled by one man, and a hierarchic, bureaucratic administration. The Chinese had created a vast network of agencies and offices that controlled every aspect of life. The emperor of the new dynasty was put into his position by the Mandarin class. The Mandarin class was a group of aristocrats who got into their government offices through a series of examinations. No matter who the emperor or the dynasty was, this class remained the same. For there to be a revolution, it would have to come from this class. This class tended to represent the people, so there were rebellions but never revolutions. There were agencies for everything from inspection and control of farms to ceremony operations. The administration developed a set of codified laws that covered everything from brawls to murder, and stipulated the punishments for each.16
When the Mongols began their raids, it was the Sung Empire that ruled in China. However, the Sung were losing power, and the period of decay had already begun. The Sung were failing to keep the economy (namely trade) stable, and the Mandarins happy. The peasants and the Mandarins were anxious for a new dynasty.

The Sung had reduced their power to mere tyranny. Their network of agencies were corrupt, often taking more tax than the emperor called for and pocketing the difference. The Sung emperor had provided for his governors. But the emperor was embroiled in wars with Mongols and Muslims, losing control by the day. Thus the provincial governors had to take control of the provinces themselves to maintain income and the economy of the areas. These governors, however, found that now they could do anything they wanted without reprimand, and often did. The emperor himself seemed to have no compassion for the peasants and their hardships. But the emperor really had no choice, for he was fighting a continuing battle against the Mongol barbarians, and it took a lot of money to keep the fight up. The only way to pay for the war was to tax the Chinese peasants heavily. The Sung were rapidly losing popularity with the people because of the taxes, and the harsh treatment the people were receiving from provincial governors, and members of the army. The idea of unity was lost, since each provincial governor basically ruled his own little country. Unity, held sacred by Buddhists and Confucianists alike, was practically non-existent. Without it, the emperor lost control of the people's hearts and minds in
those provinces, and the legitimacy to govern effectively.

For Kublai Khan, it was easy to assimilate into the Chinese administration. The Mongols were without a bureaucratic system like the one in China. They needed a government to help them consolidate their power to rule the conquered tribes they had raided, and to govern their devastated provinces.\footnote{17 Around the northern borders where the Mongols had raided, the Sung governors were often killed in an attempt to rid the area of any Sung influences, and make it easier to gain the loyalty of the peasants. The Mongols, however, did not always stick around to set up new leadership systems, because they were mainly interested in booty and glory. Therefore, those provinces had no way to reorganize or rehabilitate. The trade and commerce of these provinces was completely destroyed, stolen away by the Mongols.\footnote{18 The Mongols had control of many provinces, but didn’t have the motivation to correct problems, nor the administrative system to do so. Kublai saw the Chinese administration as the best way to consolidate this new property, and the Mongol power within. With the help of the Mandarin class, who were anxious to see China’s trade and political system revive, both sides would benefit.}

Religion in China was changing. Confucianism was on the rise. The teachings of Confucius were becoming popular with the people, since it taught unity, and harmony, which the Chinese people were anxious to have. The Tibetan priests found that Confucianism and Buddhism could be used together. They both held
common goals of neutrality, unity, and harmony. The differences seemed to lie within interpretation and specific goals. While the Buddhists stressed neutrality, the Confucianists emphasized unity, especially among family. The Confucianists, however, were more practical, concerned with everyday life.

These Tibetan Priests, and others who followed them, became the Neo-Confucianists, using the beliefs of both the religions, somewhat like Kublai's mentor Yao Chi. They combined Confucian practicality with Buddhist religious fervor.

Kublai's knowledge of this area, and the fact that the Mongols accepted this religious attitude, helped him to relate to the people of China who were accepting the new religion quickly.

As for the administration, Kublai merely renamed several of the agencies of the government, and expanded their tasks. The Sung agency for sciences which was practically non-existent due to the decline, was made into three agencies of Astronomy, Medicine, and History. Most of these agencies were used to keep the Khan informed and educated. The Mongols found what they needed in China, and the Chinese found what they needed in Kublai Khan.
Kublai Khan's Yuan Dynasty

Kublai Khan had been given the governorship of China by his brother Mangu Khan in the 1250's, and Kublai seized the opportunity. Perhaps, Mangu recognized the fact that with his education, Kublai could be effective in China. He built a beautiful palace in Shang-Tu as a base of operations to destroy the Sung Empire, a task Mangu had put him there to execute. While in China, Kublai began to realize that the Chinese administration constituted the perfect tool for consolidating Mongol power. The Mongols had never really had any kind of administrative system other than the simple kaghan-kuriltai establishment. So when Kublai came to power, he took advantage of and utilized the offices and agencies of the Chinese administration in an effort to consolidate the Mongol effort and establish a base of operations for Mongol conquest.

Kublai changed the name of the agencies and eliminated some of the less important purposes that the agencies had. These agencies were also proclaimed Mongolian, though they retained most of the functions that they previously had. They included offices for reducing tenant farming, redistributing government land to peasant farmers, and educating peasants and nomads alike about agriculture. In fact Kublai retained most of the Chinese administrators in charge of those agencies since he did not know how the system worked exactly. Kublai felt that the best way to utilize the tool was to have
someone in charge who knew how to use it. The Mandarin administrators were the only ones who could utilize the system effectively, since the Mongols had no experience with a bureaucratic administration. The Khan proclaimed them Mongolian citizens, no longer under Sung, in an effort to take their identity away and replace it with a new one to which they would be loyal. This is not to say that Kublai necessarily trusted them. Often he would send inspectors out to conquered provinces still being governed by Chinese, to check up on them and make sure his policies were being carried out. If they were not, then his Mongol inspectors would personally carry out the wishes of the Khan.

The Chinese, however, gratefully welcomed and accepted Kublai Khan. The Sung Empire had lost face with the Chinese people, and the Mandarin class, and the people were ready for a new leader who would not overtax, and overburden them to continue a war they did not want. Kublai Khan was willing to provide the Chinese with the economic reform and leadership they needed.

During his reign Kublai enacted a tax program that changed with the peasants' income. If a year was particularly bad for crops, taxes would be lowered, and sometimes not collected at all from those affected. Social welfare programs were created to benefit the old, the handicapped, and the needy. Food, clothes, household items, and tools were often given outright to the peasants. These acts of goodwill could be seen as evidence of his mother's Christian teachings.
Kublai not only accepted Christian teachings, but also advocated Neo-Confucianism, a religion that promoted the unity and harmony that the peasants were searching for amidst the problems caused by the Sung; this was a religion that the peasants were already turning towards. And when Kublai established himself in China he surrounded himself with Tibetan monks who had accepted the Neo-Confucianist beliefs. Here was yet another reason to follow the great Mongol leader. Soon after his reign began, the Chinese peasants, and later the Mandarin class, proclaimed him the Son of Heaven, a true emperor of China, entitled to the Mandate of Heaven. All the pieces began to come together. A nomadic society gone wild with conquest, in need of an administrative body to consolidate and organize its power now had the capabilities to do so by utilizing a bureaucratic administration set up by a centuries-old civilization. The Mongols also promoted a religion the Chinese accepted and believed would benefit their culture. The Mongols effectively assimilated themselves into the administration and procured a position as the new dynasty that would throw out the old (the Sung) and save the peasants of China.
Conclusion

Kublai Khan’s reign is rendered magnificent by such historians as Peter Brent, Richard Lister, James Boyle, Bertold Spuler, and W.W. Barthold. His extravagant palace and grounds, and his rich taste is illustrated by Samuel Taylor Coleridge in the poem "Kubla Khan". But, one thing such historians and poets fail to mention is how he became magnificent. They cite his social welfare programs, his "civil" way of handling the enemy, and his tolerance for foreign peoples in his realm, but they do not tell how he was motivated.24

Kublai portrayed the traditional role of kaghan, the supreme benefactor, while emperor of China, and founder of the Yuan Dynasty, which he proclaimed in 1279. He provided for all the people of his realm in the tradition of the supreme benefactor of the Mongols. When the people encountered hardships caused by environmental hazards, he suppressed tax collection. When the peasants were hungry or naked, he fed and clothed them. When it came to conquering the Sung, and driving them further south, Kublai's troops had orders from the Khan himself not to touch any non-combatant or their property. When the city of Lin-An, the Sung capital, was taken in 1279, the peasants, merchants, and farmers were not harassed, but instead left completely alone. The Sung imperial seals and state treasure were confiscated, and the four-year-old successor of the Sung was brought to Shang-tu with his mother where Kublai Khan hosted them as guests.
These were not merely political moves on Kublai's part. The reasons for his generosity and civility can be attributed to his background. He learned and embraced the teachings of his Nestorian-Christian mother and his Buddhist/Confucianist mentor, and applied these beliefs to his reign. He took the traditions of Mongol leadership and used them in his rule. He was not Machiavellian, but rather a Mongol traditionalist, and civilized. As a Mongol traditionalist he practiced the belief of a supreme benefactor, and stressed the idea of Mongol superiority. As a civilized man he respected all forms of philosophy and religion that existed in his realm, and rationally dealt with all situations that occurred.

Everything the Mongols needed, administration, economic support, and stabilization, China was able to provide. Vice versa, the things that the Chinese needed, guidance and new rule, Kublai was able to provide.

Kublai Khan broke away from the barbarity of the Mongols through his education to realize that he could be both civilized and a great leader. At the same time, he exhibited Mongol tradition that aided the people. For his time, and his race, he truly was a civilized barbarian.
Endnotes


4. There is not much evidence to explain the drastic decline in the levirate practice, but it would seem fair speculation that the nearby tribes would limit this practice considering the new Mongol supremacy. The levirate would, however, most probably be found in the settled areas, between Mongol men and women.


6. J. Holmgren, "Observations on Marriage and Inheritance Practices," p. 148. There is a problem with evidence here in regards to exactly why Tolui ceded his power to Ogadei. It can be speculated, however, that he was overwhelmed by the new system and structure Ghengiz had created.

7. There is a lack of evidence here as to why Kublai was the only son to be exposed to this education while the others spent more time with military affairs.


11. Lister, Marco Polo's Travels in Xanadu with Kublai Khan, p. 83.

12. There is a lack of evidence on this point. It is not clearly stated anywhere why Kublai was the only one to have a mentor, or even if he was the only one to have a mentor.


17. Kwanten, Imperial Nomads, p. 150.

18. Kwanten, Imperial Nomads, pp 150-153. Kwanten says that the spoils system demonstrated by the Mongols was inefficient. The provinces left behind were ruined economically and the Mongols could do nothing about it because they didn't care enough and didn't have the system to do anything. They needed Chinese administration to be able to consolidate.

19. V. A. Raisanovsky, "Mongol Law and Chinese Law in the Yuan Dynasty", pp 266-89. Raisanovsky gives a list of Mongol agencies as they were under the Sung and then under Kublai as written in the Yuan Shih Annals.


24. Thus far in the works I have studied, there seems to be no connection made between Kublai's background and his actions as Emperor of China. Most works about Kublai Khan focus on his life and military endeavors.
Bibliography


Schwartz, Benjamin The World of Thought in Ancient China.


