The Need for Multicultural Education: 
An Autoethnographic Search for Identity

An Honors Thesis (HONRS 499) 
by 
Nicole D. Randolph

Thesis Advisor 
Dr. Kenan Metzger 

Ball State University 
Muncie, Indiana 

May 2009 
Graduation Date: May 2009
Abstract

Diversity is rapidly increasing in public schools, and teachers are often unprepared to both understand and interact with the cultures they encounter, and to teach their students through multicultural education. Much qualitative research about multicultural education exists, but I have examined my own experiences as a student and pre-service teacher through autoethnography. To decide which stories to use, I focused on four research questions:

1. What makes up our identity?
2. Why is multicultural education so important to identity?
3. How can I find my identity? How do I define myself?
4. How do my students define themselves? How can we help students develop strong identities?

This has allowed me to tell my story in narrative form, and I then give an analysis of my experiences and my recommendations for other beginning teachers who find themselves unprepared to encounter diversity in their classrooms.
Acknowledgements

I want to thank Dr. Kenan Metzger for being a wonderful thesis advisor. He has been extremely patient, understanding and encouraging, and a great help to me during the entire writing process.
Literature Review

The Need for Multicultural Education and Curriculum Reform

Public education reform has been a topic of discussion and controversy as students in the United States continue to fall further behind students in other countries. What is apparent is that our educational system is failing alarming numbers of students, and while educators and politicians are demanding change, it appears that no one knows quite what to do. The student dynamic in schools is rapidly changing, and we are failing to accommodate and adapt to students' needs in this global, high-tech environment. Students are increasingly diverse, but we still rely on decades-old curriculum deemed appropriate and necessary to prepare students for their lives after high school.

Multicultural education has become an important part of the discussion about curriculum reform. We have known for years that African students are at a much higher risk than White students of being low-income, and therefore more likely to achieve lower test scores and drop out of school. The US Department of Education (2007) released a study that showed students classified as low-income (eligible for free or reduced lunch) achieve at lower levels in both math and language arts than their middle and upper-income peers. Another US Department of Education Study (Grigg, Donahue, & Dion, 2007) showed that African American and Latino students from all socioeconomic levels score lower than White students on math and reading standardized tests (pp. 6, 17). Other alarming statistics emerged from a study by Braswell, Daane & Grigg (2004), which showed 61% of African American, 53% of Latino, and 46% of Native American 8th grade students were performing below basic math levels.

As these studies on the achievement gap between White students and minorities have been conducted, a focus on multicultural education has emerged as a way to combat the
underachievement of at-risk students. Due to rapidly increasing diversity in schools and the importance of every student receiving an adequate and fair education, it is clear that multicultural education is a necessary focus today, both at the secondary level and in higher education. As I began my research on multicultural education, social justice education, and curriculum reform, I divided what I found into four areas of focus: the need for multicultural education, the benefits of multicultural education to students of all races, genders, sexual orientations, and ability levels, and the need for curriculum reform in secondary schools and in teacher education.

Research into why ethnic, low-income students fail to achieve has pointed to the fact that the curriculum in schools is Eurocentric, which means that the students who succeed with this curriculum are typically students who share that same background (Cholewa and West-Olatunji, 2008; Marri 2005). Furthermore, initial research has shown that by making connections between students’ home cultures and schools cultures can improve academic achievement, though more long-term research does need to be done to appropriately measure how much culturally responsive teaching can influence achievement. Specifically, considering the current focus on high-stakes testing, research needs to be conducted to understand how multicultural education can effect minority student achievement on standardized tests. Considering that the US Census Bureau issued population projections in August 2008 that estimated by 2043 minorities will make up 54% of the nation’s total population and that by 2050 the child population will be 62%, reaching minority students is not only a moral obligation, but also an absolute necessity for the future success of public education. These projections show that while we may still call non-White students “minority” students today, this will be a misnomer in a matter of years.

Much qualitative research about the benefits of multicultural education has been published in the past decade. I specifically looked at multicultural education in English,
composition, and social studies classrooms for the purposes of my research. In many cases, what happens is that while teachers may not recognize immediate changes in student behaviors or attitudes, students do experience changes that are “subtle and transitory,” according to Thein, Beach, and Parks (2007, p. 55). Thein, Beach and Parks studied using a “perspective-taking” approach with their white students, and found that students were much more comfortable with discussing race, racism and multiculturalism after reading multicultural literature, and that students were overall more conscious of other cultures and the perspectives of other people (p. 58). Phyllis Ngai (2006), an advocate for Native language instruction for White and Native American students, suggested these students would benefit from indigenous language instruction by gaining the ability to understand, work, and live peacefully with diverse groups of people (pp. 227-233).

Kaya Yilmaz (2008) reported that using multicultural education in social studies and history classes will “increase students’ capacity to view the past from different angles rather than impose a certain perspective on students…to help students enlarge their understanding of the increasingly interdependent social world” (p. 40). An impressive case of using multicultural and social-justice oriented teaching came from Brian D. Schultz (2007) who used project-based learning with his 5th graders in inner city Chicago. He found that over their months-long project, students who previously had been failing, absent and disconnected in school became actively involved in their group work, and that most students improved their standardized test scores significantly with no direct time spent on test preparation (p. 171). Cammarota (2007) also found implementing a social-justice oriented curriculum significantly improved the graduation rates of Latino/a students in one school district.
Research about the need for secondary curriculum reform is extensive. Christine Sleeter is a leading researcher in this field and has published numerous articles and studies in the past two decades. Her work has shown that students and teachers deserve a curriculum that allows them to make decisions in their classrooms instead of being at the bottom of a bureaucratic and ineffective hierarchy. She also makes the claim that standards-based curriculum has damaged and restricted the rights of minority students (Sleeter, 2001; Sleeter, Hughes, Meador, & Whang, 2005). Sleeter advocates heavily for involving communities in the school environment (1996, pp. 239-247). Lesley (2008) calls for curriculum reform that allows students texts that they can make personal connections to, particularly because at-risk students are often overlooked or underestimated in their abilities. Sonia Nieto, also a very dominant voice in the case for curriculum reform, says that by using a student’s culture as a basis for education, levels of achievement can dramatically improve (Nieto, 1999, 2005). The overall focus of curriculum reform revolves around giving students an understanding of his/her identity and how he/she fits into society.

The final portion of my research was over teacher--education curriculum reform. Just as secondary schools need to be reformed, the way teachers are trained to teach multicultural education needs to change as well. Sleeter is also a well-established voice in this area, calling for reform in the recruitment of teachers and for immersion programs for pre-service teachers (Sleeter, 2001, pp. 94-108). Most pre-service teachers are White, and Sleeter advocates for recruiting more teachers of color, gender, and sexual orientation, while also better preparing all teachers through updating and reforming actual teacher education programs (Sleeter 2001, Sleeter & Stillman, 2005). Milner (2008) calls for teacher education programs to expand from offering only one course on multicultural education or urban education and to move away from
teacher education programs that are centered on Whiteness. Tidwell and Thompson (2008) call for a program that prepares urban teachers by providing them with extended, immersive contact with urban schools throughout their education (pp. 86-90). Gay (2007) found that while the No Child Left Behind Act claimed to demand higher-quality teachers, it overlooked the fact that more funding would be needed to train and retain these professionals (pp. 279-293).

Increasing diversity and the necessity for education in today’s society make multicultural education an imperative solution to the problems the educational system is facing. Secondary students need an updated and culturally relevant curriculum that allows them to make sense of who they are and how they fit into the world around them. Teachers must be given the opportunity to learn how to teach the students who are currently being marginalized by our society. More research is needed to see how multicultural education can improve scores on standardized testing and on school performance in general.

**Introduction**

Our lives are full of stories, and teaching is certainly a profession full of them. All educators have stories we can tell about memorable experiences, students that have changed our lives, moments when everything we ever learned or knew suddenly changed. As a teacher, I have traveled a long road from my childhood in an all-White community to my present-day focus on multicultural education. This is the story of my journey into teaching, as told through autoethnography.

In the past decade, autoethnography as qualitative research has become a popular way to explore and discuss teaching and learning (Banks and Banks, 2000, as cited by Hughes, 2008, p.127). The form of autoethnography is a narrative where the researcher tells a story and
evaluates what her experiences mean to her life and to the profession (Jones, 2005, as cited by Belbase, 2008, p.3). Luitel (2003, as cited by Belbase, 2008, p.3) says that autoethnography “…signifies the textual representation of one’s own personal experiences in his/her social, political, economic and cultural context.”

Hughes (2008) states that there are “three bridges connecting autoethnography to reflexivity, teaching, and learning” (p. 127). First, autoethnography challenges what we assume to be normal and forces us to examine how we socialize personally and professionally. Second, it can teach us to write and share emotions with an audience, and third, it allows us space to learn and discuss our own experiences with inequity and oppression that is present in our classrooms (Hughes, 2008, p.127).

I have chosen autoethnography because I know that my stories are important in the understanding of what it is like to be a White woman pre-service teacher who is trying to examine and understand the concept of race, and to combat and come to terms with her own racism. This journey is important to the profession because self-reflection has led me to the development of a strong and unwavering identity, and developing an identity, a meaning, a purpose, is where we are failing so many of our students today.

Throughout this autoethnography I have used many different forms of research. I have used my personal experiences throughout my teacher education coursework at Ball State University and my experiences as an active volunteer in several different organizations throughout my five years as an undergraduate. I have also used field observations I have made throughout my time as a pre-service teacher in Muncie Community Schools, as well as many student artifacts from my time as a student teacher at Frankfort High School in Frankfort, Indiana. All of these sources help me to examine multicultural education and the formation of
The need for multicultural education

identity, and how we can help students develop positive identities that help them understand who they are and where they belong.

To decide which stories to use, I focused on four research questions:

1. What makes up our identity?
2. Why is multicultural education so important to identity?
3. How can I find my identity? How do I define myself?
4. How do my students define themselves? How can we help students develop strong identities?

Results

How can I find my identity? How do I define myself?

Our teacher’s assistant passed out an article while we were talking about race. I looked at the list of 26 situations where the author encountered white privilege and everything changed for me. “26. I can choose blemish cover or bandages in “flesh” color and have them more or less match my skin” (McIntosh, 1988, p. 150). How could I have never even thought about how easy I had it? I had never given thought to how I might be treated differently because of my skin color, because I am White. No one would ever ask me to speak on behalf of everyone who was White, nor would someone call me a credit to my race just because I was going to college.

But now, what? I could not understand how just having my skin color meant I was automatically privileged. However, there were those 26 reasons, all of which applied to me, too. Could I do something to equalize the problem? Was it my problem to fix? I did not ask to be White, but no one else asked to be Black or Hispanic, or an “other” either. What could I do? Does this mean that when I am a teacher my students are going to make assumptions about me just because I am White? Am I going to assume things about my students just because they are a
different color than me? And how is it that just having a different skin color makes someone’s life so radically different from mine? These questions would continue to plague me for the rest of my college experience, and will certainly follow me throughout my life.

What makes up our identity? How do my students define themselves?

Four years later, I am making a poster about myself for my first day of student teaching. To get to know my students, we will all trace our feet onto colorful sheets of paper and then describe the “footsteps” we wish to make in the coming school year. Trying to decide what I should put around my foot is another story. What do I want them to know about me? I settle on a picture of my iPod, drawings of books, a guitar, and a soccer ball. I am so much more than these things, though, I just do not know how to express it to my students. It is simple to reduce myself to a few little symbols, but it’s the big picture I’m still trying to figure out. Hopefully in the next few months I will help my students to begin developing their big pictures, too. “We’re all the same,” I want to tell them. We are all just trying to figure out who we are.

Why is multicultural education so important to identity? How can we help students develop strong identities?

At the end of our unit on Native Americans, my students watched the wonderful film “Smoke Signals.” I knew they would love it, and I was pleased to see that it caught everyone’s attention, even those students who had checked out of class from the beginning. They laughed, they chattered, they were silent when Victor and Thomas were verbally assaulted on the bus. When the movie ended, I asked them to write me an essay about how Victor and Thomas met some of the stereotypes they had about Native Americans, and how they differed from the stereotypes.
Allison (I have changed all student names) wrote a very good essay about ways Native Americans are typically stereotyped. She said “Instead of being educated about the Native American culture, people choose to form opinions based on what they see in the media...Stereotypes aren’t only believed by the public, but many Native Americans have stereotyped themselves. They believe that because many people believe certain things about their culture, they should act in a certain way to bring truth to the stereotypes. In “Smoke Signals,” Victor tries to convince Thomas to act more like a “real Indian.” He tells Victor to take out his braids, change his suit, and to have a stoic look on his face. Because other people have this stereotype about Native Americans, Victor thinks he has to live up to those stereotypes...like the Native Americans, other races and cultures are also stereotyped. Instead of forming uneducated opinions about a person’s culture, race or religion, we should all become more informed to avoid hurting another person.”

Nick, our Brazilian exchange student, had a difficult time understanding what stereotypes were. He had not grown up here, and he did not bring the same life experiences to the class that the other students did. I had not considered this when I wrote the essay topic, but it was one of countless learning experiences for me as a teacher. “Well,” I said as I sat down with him, “who [sic] do you make fun of in Brazil? Is there a certain group of people that everyone else mocks or treats badly or says bad things about?” He laughed. “Sure,” he said, “We make fun of the Portuguese.” I told him “Perfect. That’s what I’m asking you to do. Think about why you consider the Portuguese as so different from yourself, and then apply that to the essay. What makes Victor and Thomas different?”

Nick’s essay was a great effort and showed me that he understood what I wanted him to get from the movie. He wrote, “People think that Native Americans are lazy, alcoholic, and
stupid. But in [the] movie “Smoke Signals” we could see Victor and Thomas both didn’t drink. Actually, Victor hate [sic] alcoholic drink because [his] parents used [to] drink a lot. Once when Victor [sic] mom saw him breaking the beer she decide [sic] to stop drink [sic] because she saw that was a bad influence to her son.”

Why is multicultural education so important to identity?

Getting my students to write personal narratives was difficult. They claimed to not have anything to write about. They did not understand the point. Nothing had ever happened to them, nothing important enough to write three pages about, anyway. It did not matter how much I tried to tell them their stories mattered, or how many ideas I tried to throw at them. There were students in both of my classes who were clearly struggling with having to tell their stories. I was trying desperately to get them past basic essays about their lives and to dig into what one event really meant to them. As an example, I read my students a chapter called “School” from The Color of Water: A Black Man’s Tribute to His White Mother by James McBride.

As soon as I read the title I heard chatter: “What? How is he black and she’s white?” I told them the improbable story of how McBride’s mother converted to Christianity from Judaism, was abandoned by her family, married an African American in Brooklyn and had twelve children. I passed out copies of the chapter, and my students followed along as I read aloud. My favorite part of the chapter received laughs from everyone. James was in the kitchen while his mother was cooking, and he asked her,

“Am I black or white?”

“You’re a human being,” she snapped. “Educate yourself or you’ll be a nobody!”

“Will I be a black nobody or just a nobody?”

“If you’re a nobody,” she said dryly, “it doesn’t matter what color you are.” (92).
I hoped my students were really, truly listening.

◆

*How do my students define themselves? How can we help students develop strong identities?*

To help with the personal narrative writing process, we made “Life Maps” where everyone drew a map of ten significant events in their lives. Reading these showed me how many stories everyone had to tell. Several students had children. Several others had moved from Mexico, some very recently. Others had lost loved ones, or were abandoned by parents. They all had something to say, they were just afraid to say it. How could I make them realize that all of these stories made them who they were? And how could I get them to embrace the things that happened as part of the identities they were developing? So many of them had had such terrible things happen to them, and in the end this just wasn’t something I could figure out my first time around.

◆

*How can I find my identity? How do I define myself?*

I vividly remember the two coldest nights of my life. One was spent 400 yards from the coast of the Gulf of Mexico, weeks after Hurricane Katrina devastated New Orleans and the coast of Mississippi. I was in a small tent in Pass Christian, Mississippi, and the wind whipped the tent so hard that I could not sleep. I shivered the night away, and rejoiced when the grey dawn appeared through the nylon ceiling. Our group of 12 college students grabbed breakfast at the FEMA camp and headed to the home of a man who needed help clearing his yard. During our few days there, we picked up trash and limbs and sawed up a huge tree that had fallen in the back yard.
The other night was spent in a huge parking lot at Soldier Field in Chicago, where I tried
to sleep on cold asphalt with my head in a cardboard box. About 80 students from Ball State
drove the 4 hours north to take part in “Displace Me,” a nationwide event where people spent a
night away from their homes to raise awareness about the plight of people in displacement camps
in Central Africa. We wrote letters, decorated our “homes”, heard from the refugees themselves,
and sat silently, 5000 people, dedicated to one cause—bringing these people home.

Why do these nights mean so much to me? They have led me to a huge part of who I
am—immersing myself in things that are bigger than I am. I did not make any money doing
these things, and it was a lot of work both times. But I helped someone, and I was changed, and
if I have learned one thing about identity, it is that when you try to lose it, that is when you find
it. I found myself when I lost myself in the task of helping someone who needed it.

Why is multicultural education so important to identity? How do my students define themselves?
How can we help students develop strong identities?

My American Literature students were reading The Great Gatsby. I saved it until the end
of our trimester because I loved it so much and I wanted it to be the end of our time together.
The last time I read it I had been a freshman in college, four long years ago. This time as I read
it, I realized how much it bothered me that I did not know why Jay Gatsby changed his name. It
was something we had not really talked about before, and I wanted to know what my students
thought about it now.

I asked them why they thought Jay changed his name from James Gatz, and I asked them
what would ever motivate them to change their identities. Their responses, for the most part,
were insightful and mature. Jose, a migrant student, wrote, “I would change my name and I
would change where I came from because people where I come from hate my family for what
another people did. I would change my name because people know my name but they don’t know who I am...I think that Gatsby change his name because he doesn’t want people to know who he really is. He doesn’t want to be known because he just don’t [sic] want to. Maybe he just want [sic] to start a new life.”

Paul wrote “Born....I was the son of...who had a total often children together. In 2001 I was removed from their care due to neglect and sexual abuse. To distance myself from the nightmare and to make myself sound more interesting I have changed my name to Konta Djak. Konta Djak is the name of one of the main characters in a story I wrote entitled “Journey of a Jedi”...Gatsby also changed his name to distance himself from his past.”

◆

Analysis

Each of these stories has had a significant impact on who I am as a person and as a teacher. I learned an incredible amount during my time as a teacher education student, and as I make my way into the field as a “real teacher”, I have realized many things that make my experiences unique. During my education, I was fortunate enough to consistently encounter teachers who were passionate about multiculturalism and who were not afraid to ask big questions when there were no real answers. I also had many multicultural experiences in the communities where I volunteered and campaigned. Nevertheless, I was only required to take one course on multicultural education, and that was during my sophomore year of college. If colleges and universities want to adequately prepare beginning teachers for life in the real world, then reform needs to come to teacher education programs. Students should encounter multicultural education on a constant and consistent basis so they are engaged and ready to confront the realities of racism, sexism, and prejudices against sexual orientation.
An essential way to meet these multicultural education goals is to send pre-service teachers into communities they are unfamiliar with. It is easy to fear, judge, and otherwise stereotype people and communities that we do not know, but being there brings a new level of understanding that teachers need if they are going to have a real, positive impact on students. My experiences as a student teacher and simply as a volunteer tutor, aide, and human rights advocate all shaped who I am and the ideas I bring to my classroom. Every teacher education student needs to have experiences like these that push him or her beyond where they are comfortable—experiences that encourage the reconsideration of what it means to be a teacher, an adult, a citizen of this planet.

Curriculum reform is necessary at the middle and high school level as well. While there are certainly multicultural themes in required curriculums, often students read the same group of authors, and the material is irrelevant to students today. Students do respond to multicultural literature, as is evidenced by my classroom experiences with authors like Sherman Alexie, Louise Erdrich, and James McBride. Students like stories they can connect to, and these stories had themes like alcoholism, problems with parents, characters struggling with identities, and they were contemporary. Our Eurocentric curriculum is failing students because it fails to take into account the different cultures that students have grown up in. Children from different cultures will naturally have different expectations of school, and it is unfair to expect that the same school will adequately meet the needs of every student. In the face of rapidly increasing diversity in our country, schools need to take the initiative to prepare students for a diverse society by introducing them to multiculturalism all throughout their education and not just during one or two units of study.
Multicultural curriculum has numerous benefits for middle and high school age students, but most importantly it gives students the opportunity to develop a strong sense of identity. Themes in multicultural literature often center on trying to figure out how one person fits into a larger community, and this is an essential part of growing up. Unfortunately many students lack support systems at home and therefore are totally reliant upon school to give them that sense of identity. In turn, as teachers we get lost in the enormous task of covering the required material and making sure our students are prepared for testing.

We fail our students when we let them drop out or graduate with no real sense of who they are or how they fit into society. Multicultural education gives students a chance to really think about who they are, and who their classmates are, and how they all fit together in society. It is essential to teach our students these multicultural ideas because students who are not prepared to meet diversity in the world are simply not prepared for working and living with people who are “different.” Though curriculum reform is certainly a necessity, we have the chance to ask students to consider who they are with curriculum now, such as my students discussing why they think James Gatz changed his name and considering what would motivate them to change their names and identities. Many of my students thought James Gatz changed his name because he was ashamed of his past, and that is a theme to which they can relate. Paul’s moving essay about his traumatic past is just one example of how much students have been through and how important it is to give them an outlet to express their feelings about who they are and who they can become.

As teachers we cannot expect to be truly effective for our students until we have a grasp of who we are and who we want our students to be at the end of their time with us. As I progressed through my education I realized that my goal as a teacher is to introduce students to
The need for multicultural education

ideas and experiences that are bigger than they are. I want to pass on to my students the feeling I get from volunteering. I want them to know the satisfaction I experienced when I awoke freezing and stiff from a night spent sleeping in a parking lot so that maybe I could help save child soldiers in Uganda. I want them to know the relief and gratitude I received from victims of Hurricane Katrina. I also want to continually question my place in society and I want my students to know that identity is something that is fluid, something that can and will change as we grow and reflect on who we have been and who we want to become.

Conclusion

The Eurocentric curriculum in our schools today reaches beyond what we teach. It is intertwined with the ways we run our schools, how we interact with students, parents, and communities, and how we teach. To truly reach multicultural communities would require a massive, concerted effort to rethink and redesign how we do education in this country. It is absolutely worth the effort, but it remains to be seen whether our government and our leaders are ready to step forward and make a radical change to better prepare our young people to be active, engaged participants in our global society.

While we may not see massive changes in our educational system during our time as teachers, there are certainly small-scale changes we can all make in our own classrooms. First, get students reading current and engaging multicultural literature. There are so many wonderful books available for young adults today. Bring them into your classrooms and give students the opportunity to learn about the people and cultures around them. Second, do not be afraid to ask yourself and your students big questions. It can be intimidating to address issues of racism and white privilege, but confronting these issues in your classroom gives students a safe place to
consider and learn about injustices in our society. It is ok if we do not have the answers, and it is beneficial for students to understand that not every problem will necessarily have a simple solution. Third, push for reform in your schools. Get multicultural literature into the curriculum. Push for activities and experiences that broaden the global perspectives of your students and your communities. Small steps lead to larger changes.

While we can call for large-scale reform, it is unlikely to happen without research backing the benefits to students. More research needs to be conducted so teachers and administrators can understand how multicultural education benefits students of all races and socioeconomic status. We need to understand how the way we teach impacts the performance of multicultural students. As a beginning teacher, I plan on implementing the suggestions I have made here in my classroom so that I may begin preliminary research.
References


