PAST EXPERIENCE IN MUSIC EDUCATION AND ITS EFFECT
ON THE PERCEPTION OF GENERAL MUSIC CLASSES
AMONG PARENTS
A RESEARCH PROJECT
SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE
MASTER OF MUSIC EDUCATION
BY
DANIELLE CARTER
DR. ANN HICKS – ADVISOR
BALL STATE UNIVERSITY
MUNCIE, INDIANA
MAY 2018
INTRODUCTION

Elementary music classrooms today are different from elementary music classrooms of the past. Throughout the past of music education, its status among the curricular subjects such as math or English/language arts has been diminished. In the Magna Carta of Music Education in 1839, music teachers strived to prove music as a curricular subject, equal to all other subjects (Mark, 2008). This has finally come to fulfillment with the latest legislation from the federal government with the signing of the Every Student Succeeds Act. Under this new law, music and art are now considered curricular subjects. They are listed as essential to a well-rounded education (Every Student Succeeds Act, 2015). The ESSA is an effective advocacy tool in the hands of the music teachers across the United States.

Administrators hold music teachers accountable for meeting this requirement by asking for more rigorous curricula that gives evidence of student learning. Students are asked to perform and create music in various ways, and to learn the history of music and make connections to other subjects more than in years past. Teachers and students have become aware of these changes in the every day activities in the music classroom. Parents, on the other hand, may not realize all of the changes that have taken place.

Often, parents are unaware how their student is performing in music class until the report card comes home. Some ask questions, such as: “Why did my child receive an F in music?” “All you do is sing, right?” “Does this mean my child is a bad singer?” Music teachers frequently hear all of these questions and many more. It seems that some parents may be naïve of what actually occurs in the music
classroom. This disconnect can hinder a music program and destroy the cooperative relationship teachers strive for with parents. Parental involvement in their students’ music program is usually demonstrated through their concert attendance. This may be the only exposure some parents have to what students are doing in class until that report card comes home. As a result parents are confused and do not understand why their student received a bad grade.

The parents’ confusion is most likely caused by comparing the educational experiences from their past to the experiences of their children. What parents remember most from their music classes is singing from a book and playing the recorder. They may have received a grade for this music class, but the class was considered an “easy A” or a “breeze class.” The National Standards for Music Education were not integrated into music curriculum until 1994. Therefore, most parents of today’s students did not receive music instruction that required teachers to cover specific topics within music. Another factor may be that parents experienced an unpleasant encounter in a music class where they felt judged by the teacher or had a bad performance that affected how they feel toward music as a whole. The opposite of this could be that parents had a great experience in music classes and pursued a musical education beyond elementary school. A single experience can affect the attitude towards music and music education (Mursell, 1934). Howard Gardner and his Theory of Multiple Intelligences, as explained by Luehrman, described a phenomenon called a crystalizing experience. A crystalizing experience is when a person has an impactful experience in a specific domain of learning that affects that person’s attitude and self-image in that domain.
(Luehrman, 2002). A crystalizing experience(s) in the subject of music could affect how a parent perceives music as subject for their student.

Another area of study is parental awareness of National and State standards and various milestones students are expected to achieve at the different grade levels. Students are expected to do a lot more in music class than just sing, as some parents may assume. State law requires teacher accountability, which pushes teachers to create a more demanding curriculum and assessments that provide data to administrators. Teachers are expected to monitor student progress to prove their own effectiveness and student learning. Therefore students learn more theory, have more creative projects, and learn more about world cultures and music history than most parents realize. Along with singing and playing of instruments, these activities provide teachers with ample opportunities to assess student learning in the subject area of music. Unfortunately, students cannot be relied upon to take completed work home for parents to view, thus leaving the parents ignorant of the activities in music class.

How parents view music education in elementary schools can affect the parent-teacher relationship, music advocacy efforts, and student achievement. Programs such as a “Connecting Parents with Learning Project”, help create a forum for parents and teachers to share what is happening in the classroom. This can lead to an increase in student achievement and create a community of parents, students, and teachers that fosters a constructive learning environment (Towsend, 2010). Parental involvement can benefit any educational program is going to be beneficial. In a study by Kalandyk (1996), the effect of music and the self-esteem of young
children were observed. A group of students, whose parents were involved, was compared to a group of students that were taught “child-alone.” The group of students with parents in attendance resulted with an increase in concentration and effort, which allowed the children improve their skills (1996). With this project, parents had access to lessons and the information the children were learning. However, if parents are unaware of what is happening in the classroom, then the parents are not fully equipped to help the students. Also, if they have preconceived attitudes toward music from a previous experience, the teacher must find a way to disconnect the music education of the student from that of the parent.

The purpose of this study was to evaluate how the past experiences of parents affect their perception of music education for their children. The findings could lead to better parent-teacher relations, better advocacy, and higher student achievement. The following questions were created in order to measure parents’ attitudes about music at the elementary level:

1. What is the relationship between parents’ past experiences in music and their current perceptions of elementary general music?
2. Are parents aware of new standards and methods being used in the music classrooms?
3. What do parents believe should be included and assessed in music as a subject?
LITERATURE REVIEW

A study in Great Britain examined the interest of parents in music activities in various settings and locations (Addison, 1990). Addison and ten other teachers created a questionnaire asking parents from their respective schools about music activities that occur in the home and the importance of various activities within the music curriculum. Therefore the sample for the study was pulled from many different locations throughout Great Britain. Only 55.5% of the parents contacted responded, with four types of locations, inner city, housing estate, rural/mining area, and rural Northumberland. The results show that parents acknowledge that children sing at home, the tunes of various T.V. ads, radio songs, playground songs, and more. Out of the respondents, 25% claimed that an adult in the home played a musical instrument. When asked about music being included in all primary schools, 75% agreed with a high percentage of respondents claiming they should learn songs, play percussion instruments, read and listen to music, learn about composers, learn about music of the past and different cultures, dance, and learn a musical instrument in these music classes. These categories seem to match to the Music Education standards implemented in America four years later. The results concluded that both parents, who had music in the home and those who had very little interest in music, gave great value to music in primary school’s curriculum. This interest can extend beyond parents wishes for their children and into what they wish to achieve for themselves.

In 1991, Bowels examined the correlation between interest in adult music education and adult experiences in music (1991). A random sample (N=275) of
audience members for the University of Texas Performing Arts Center was surveyed using a 55-questionnaire. This questionnaire contained three sections that asked about musical experiences, musical interest, and music education opportunity preferences. A panel of experts reviewed the data and found that many of the adults who were interested in various aspects of music education were also consumers of music and enjoyed musical experiences either by participating or watching musical activities. The researcher concluded that music education programs within universities should consider the interests of these types of adults when designing adult music education programs to increase enrollment. This result asks for further study into whether or not universities are giving enough opportunities for adults to participate in music experiences. James Mursell, in his book Human Values in Music Education (1934) describes the need for meaningful experiences in life to really learn different material. Mursell believed that students do not learn by merely drilling facts and figures, but really learn by having experiences in subject areas, such as music that stand out, and make them feel important. The Bowels study revealed that adults may not be able to have these meaningful experiences because a lack of relevant music courses in local colleges. When adults collect these meaningful experiences, it can boost their value of music they can then share with their children.

Mizener examined the attitudes of elementary students towards singing and participating in choir were examined in 1993. Students in grades 3-6 from a large, urban school district, were given a questionnaire (N=542). The students were measured on their responses to 44 items from the following categories: a.) singing
interest, b.) choir participation, c.) classroom singing activities, d.) out-of-school singing experiences, and e.) self-perception of singing skill. This questionnaire was read aloud to the students to complete, then a sample of these students (n=123) was selected for a singing assessment for “Jingle Bells” and a familiar song of their choice such as “Twinkle, Twinkle Little Star.” The results of this study showed that the interest in singing and participation in choir declined by grade level and that girls tended to have a higher interest in singing than boys. The singing assessment showed that there was no significant difference in singing skill between those who perceive themselves to be good singers and those who do not. The researcher concluded that students generally like singing, with girls having a higher percentage of a positive attitude towards singing than boys. The researchers also found that participation in musical activities at school tend to be higher when they are supported by positive attitudes towards music at home with friends and family.

There have been different studies that examined the perceptions of principals and teachers about the fine arts as curricular subjects in public schools. However not many exist that measure the perceptions of parents on music education. Luehrman examined the opinions and attitudes of principals towards art education (2002). A group of 297 of Missouri Public School principals were surveyed about their past experiences in Art Education both at school and home. The questionnaire covered topics such as art class experiences, art opportunities, exposure to works of art, attitude towards art from parents and family members, current feelings and attitude towards art, and a chance to share a meaningful experience whether it good or bad. Participants were given the chance to volunteer
to be interviewed and 6 of these volunteers were chosen to share their personal experiences with the researcher. Luehrman found that experiences of the participants did have a direct effect on their opinions and attitudes towards Art Education. Participants who had positive experiences in school or even during teaching certification had more positive and supportive roles in Art Education in their schools. Participants who had negative experiences showed a negative or indifferent attitude toward Art Education. However, some participants experienced a change of opinion if a new experience made an impact on them.

I felt I had no art talent. I don’t remember in junior high every receiving any praise for effort. I also don’t recall learning concepts. Today, when I visit art classes at the elementary level, I am amazed at the knowledge that is taught and the application of concepts. I’m finally being taught. (Luehrman, 2002, p.203)

Luehrman found that a positive environment in the classroom fosters a positive experience that can lead to a lifetime appreciation of art and willingness to advocate for Art Education. The appreciation for art doesn’t end when the school bell rings. Students can take that affinity for art and share with those within their household and circle of friends. This can also happen in music.

The appreciation for art and music isn’t confined to only location in a person’s life. In Hong Kong, 19 families were interviewed in a qualitative study to look for interconnected themes in learning and participating in music (Ho, 2009). The researcher wished to gain a better understanding how much parents and students shared music, the nature of learning a musical instrument, and the extent of parental support in music education. Over the course of four months, the families
were interviewed, with each child interviewed separately. Most of these studies were conducted in their homes, but some had to be relocated to a public place. Questions in the interviews were mostly open-ended questions that allowed the participants to remark on their favorite leisure activities, types of music they listen to, if their parents or friends encourage them to attend concerts, what type of music learning do they participate in school. Parents were asked to remark on their musical backgrounds, their support of their children’s musical activities, the significance of music lessons in school, and their expectations of their children’s music education. The researcher found that while the parents did support their children’s music learning, very few families had shared musical interests. The conclusion of the study revealed that though parents had little influence on what their children learned in their musical studies, the parents’ support and positive attitudes towards music education affected the children’s willingness to participate in other music activities and further their music education.

In a different study, Abril and Gault (2009) measured the perceptions of elementary teachers about music instruction in the elementary classroom. A random sample of both in-service teachers from the Midwest region of the United States and pre-service teachers from various universities that were enrolled in music methods classes from the same region were surveyed. This mixed methods study used a 6-point Likert type scale to measure how participants valued the goals of elementary music instruction. The researchers also included a short section in the questionnaire that asked the participants to discuss any past musical experiences. Results showed that even though both groups showed an appreciation
for the curricular goals of music instruction, the two groups differed on the primary goals of music instruction in the classroom. The pre-service teachers valued the entertainment and creativity goals in music instruction. In-service teachers valued the socio-cultural and musical goals more for the use of music in classroom instruction. Researchers concluded that universities and colleges that offer music methods courses give their teacher candidates the tools and information to better use music in the classroom. When these teaching candidates become practicing teachers, their value of music can be integrated into their teaching, giving a more meaningful learning experience to their students. These students can then benefit from their teachers by witnessing the teacher's appreciation of music.

A group of middle school students were asked to define the meaning of music to them in 2009 (Davis). Middle school students enrolled in general music classes, but not any ensembles, across several states were surveyed (N=762). The students were selected on the basis of the keenness of their teachers to participate. They were given an instrument entitled Music Meaning Survey that asked students to rate on a Likert-type scale what they enjoyed or found important in music class. There were 50 statements which students were asked to rank, ranging from "to be able to read music in the future," to "to talk to others." The responses were calculated into four categories vocational, academic, belongingness, and agency, or psychological benefits. The most meaningful category to the students was the vocational category, followed in order by academic, belongingness, and lastly agency. The conclusion of this study was that these middle school students found music class to be a
meaningful experience from which students can benefit in multiple ways even if they do not participate in ensembles.

Parents also hold a high place of value to music education. Marigotta investigated the role that parents play in their child learning to play the piano was studied (2011). Thirty-four students and their parents were studied in three different learning environments, a school, private lessons, and a music conservatory. After 4 to 18 months parents and students were asked to describe their enjoyment of attending lessons, how they supervised practice, and their musical backgrounds. Results showed that the parents’ musical background had little or no effect to the success of the students’ learning. However, the parents’ positive influence during practice after attending lessons helped students to improve their experiences. Marigotta concluded that the students with the highest-level achievement in learning the piano had self-motivation and determination to do so. Positive parental involvement aided in this determination by allowing parents to know what the instructors expected of the students therefore allowing them to be able to guide and help the students when practicing. Teachers connecting to the parents at the level of instruction of the student, allows for a teacher-parent cooperation that benefits music learning. This could be an effective tool for music teachers in advocating for their music programs.

In a 2015 article, the Journal of Research in Music Education reported on the findings of C.R. Abril and J.K. Bannerman on the music teacher’s feelings of their own advocacy efforts (2015). A randomly selected sample of 1,000 music teachers was surveyed from a target population of 30,000. A 5-part questionnaire was given to
participants. Part 1 asked for demographic information, and in Part 2 participants were asked to rate 19 different factors that may impact a music program from the school level to federal level. Part 3 asked participants to define what actions impacted teachers' positions or programs, and Part 4 measured how teachers felt about different groups or individuals influenced music programs. Part 5 asked two open-ended questions that had the participants to describe the greatest obstacle they had faced in their own music programs and who or what was critical to maintaining or improving their programs. Results showed that the teachers felt their curriculum was closely related to the National and State standards, and the teacher themselves were the biggest influences affecting their own programs. However, budget cuts and situations where music teachers have been asked to teach outside their content area are negatively affecting their programs. Abril and Bannerman concluded that teachers can do a lot at the school-level to advocate for their music programs with face-to-face communications and getting parents involved. When teachers affiliate with other music teachers, other educators within their school system, and the community, they can create alliances that they can use for advice and support when needed. Professional organizations can also aid music teachers with the resources they need to rally the cause for the music programs (2015).

These various studies overwhelmingly indicate the importance of support of parents, teachers, and administrators for the motivation of students in their education. The efforts of music teachers to boost support for their music programs can be assisted by parents and administrators within the school community.
Unfortunately, parents’ attitudes towards music education can vary from negative to positive. How these opinions were formed can carry a strong attachment to the parent, and can either help or hinder the music teachers’ efforts to gain the parental support.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study was conducted to examine the attitudes of parents towards elementary general music and how past experiences of the parents have affected their views. This research is a quantitative design with a descriptive component. The target population for this study was parents of students between the ages of 5-12. For the purpose of this study a convenience sample was generated through the researchers email contact list of parents of current elementary-age students within the local school corporation (N= 2,842). Snowball sampling was encouraged to gain a better response return. A questionnaire was created using an online tool, Kwiksurveys.com, with three main parts. Participants were given two weeks to respond to the questionnaire.

The main variable of interest was the attitude of the parents towards music education. Therefore part 1 consisted of a series of 19 statements that the participants indicated how they agree or disagree using a 4-point, Likert-type scale. Responses were given a score of 1 to 4, with 1 being strongly disagree and 4 being strongly agree. Another variable of interest in this study was the correlation to musical experiences of the parents and if they affected the parents’ perceptions. Part 2 asked a series of questions about the musical backgrounds of the participants,
and cumulated with two open-ended questions that asked participants to share any meaningful experiences from their past and how they would describe their feelings towards music in schools. Part 3 concluded the questionnaire by having the participants fill out a few demographic questions. The descriptive background information was analyzed for any common themes. For the affective section of the questionnaire, the possible attitudinal scores were evenly distributed to create the following rubric:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitudinal Score</th>
<th>Attitudinal Classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19-32</td>
<td>Very Unfavorable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33-47</td>
<td>Unfavorable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48-62</td>
<td>Favorable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63-76</td>
<td>Very Favorable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Content validity for the measurement tool was established by an expert in the field of research. The expert was asked to give any suggestions to improve the questionnaire or sampling choice. A pilot test was given in July 2017 with a population of N=49. Eight complete responses were recorded from the emails sent out. For perception of music elementary scores from the first section of the questionnaire, the scores ranged from 19-76. The mean from the scores of the participants was 59, with the standard deviation being 9. All the scores fit in the favorable and very favorable range of the Attitudinal Score Rubric. A surprising finding from the pilot test was the negative correlation of $p = -0.415$ between parents participation in ensembles after elementary school and the parents’ perception scores. The pilot also gave substance to the researcher’s theory about age of the
respondent and the content of their music classes. There was a significant negative correlation, showing that older generations of parents had a less varied musical education than what is currently being taught in the music classroom. The researcher made minor adjustments to the questionnaire before opening the survey to the families of elementary-aged students throughout the school district.

Participants received an introductory email about the opportunity to participate in the study. The next day participants were sent an email with the actual link to the questionnaire. The participants were allowed two weeks to complete the questionnaire. A reminder email was sent out in the last few days of the two-week window. Participants were offered a chance to enter a drawing for a gift card to a local restaurant at the end of the survey.

RESULTS

The questionnaire received a 3.7% return from the population. There were 105 total responses with only 91 questionnaires being fully completed, n=91. The sample studied, included 80 female respondents and 11 male respondents who all hold varying levels of education. The majority of the respondents reported having at least 2 children in the household that are currently enrolled in an elementary school.

The 19 Likert-type questions gave each respondent an attitudinal score that measured their perception of common elementary music practices. These questions were based on the nine National Standards for Music along with questions about grading, assessment, and homework. The mean attitudinal score was 59.85,
placing the majority of the respondents in the Favorable to Very Favorable Range.

The following table shows the frequency data gathered from these questions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perception</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Error of Skewness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second section of the questionnaire asked respondents about their past musical involvement. Respondents were asked to indicate their enjoyment of the elementary music class and if they participated in ensembles. Ninety-five percent of the respondents reported they enjoyed their elementary music experience, and 71% reported that they participated in a musical ensemble after elementary school. A Pearson correlation test was conducted using the variables of the perception scores and the enjoyment of the respondents’ elementary music experience. The results showed a -.109 correlation, which shows a weak, negative correlation between the variables. The following table shows the results.
A second Pearson correlation test was conducted between the attitudinal scores and the age of the respondents. This gave the result of 0.017, which is a very small or weak correlation between the variables. The following table shows the results.

| Music Perception and Musical Experience Correlation |
|----------------------------------------|-------|-------|
| Perception                              | 1     | -0.109 |
| Sig. (2-tailed)                         |       | 0.305  |
| N                                      | 91    | 91    |
| Experience                             | -0.109 | 1     |
| Sig. (2-tailed)                         | 0.305  |       |
| N                                      | 91    | 91    |

This second section of the questionnaire also asked respondents to share any meaningful experiences from their music classes, including both positive and negative experiences, and how they felt about music’s inclusion in the elementary school curriculum. From the first open-ended question about meaningful
experiences there were several common themes. Some positive themes included were music gave them confidence, provided enjoyment, built teamwork skills, allowed for family involvement, and gave music appreciation to the respondent. Two negative themes that were expressed were embarrassment and performing alone.

The second open-ended question was about how the respondents feel about music being included in the elementary curriculum. A few common themes found were having various opportunities for students show different talents, providing a well-rounded education, allowing a mental break for students, and creating family and community connections. There were no negative perspectives reported.

DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study was to examine any correlations between parents' past experiences in music class and their perception of current elementary school music practices. The correlation value from this test was -.109. Due to the construction of the device with only a yes or no answer option, this was an expected outcome. It means the respondents who had an enjoyable elementary music experience had a higher opinion of current elementary music education than those respondents who answered no. This helped to answer the first question of this study,

The second correlation test measured the respondents’ age groups versus their attitudes of current elementary music education and found a very weak correlation of .017. This indicates a slightly higher opinion of elementary music
with respondents who are in the older age groups. However, the correlation is so small that it really is a miniscule connection. This is a slightly more surprising outcome. The hypothesis of the researcher was that older generations would have a lower perception of elementary music due to the fact that the National Standards of Music Education were not included in public school curriculum until 1994. The majority of the respondents fell into the age group of 25-40. This would put the youngest respondents from this category in middle school or junior high when the National Standards were required in the elementary curriculum. Therefore all the respondents over the age of 25, 90 respondents, may not have had the varied subject matter covered by the standards taught to them. When asked what subjects were covered in their elementary music classes, 98% reported singing and 71% reported playing instruments. Only 10% of the respondents reported composing music.

The second area of interest in this study asked if parents were aware of the standards and methods being utilized in the current elementary school curriculum. It is likely that parents of the ages 25 and older were unaware of what the National Standards of Music Education are and that they are required within the music curriculum. The current standards fall into three categories, creating, performing, and responding. The skills that fall under these categories include singing, playing instruments, improvising, composing, reading music, and responding to music from various cultures and periods in history (Standards). The 19 Likert-type items in the survey asked the respondents rate their level of agreement to these standards. Seventy-two percent of the respondents agreed that students should learn to sing
and improvise songs in music class, 66% of the respondents agreed that students should learn to play instruments, and 64% agreed that students should learn to read notation. A surprising find from these questions was that 25% disagreed with students learning to compose their own music in class. This would be an interesting area to conduct a follow up study to investigate why this percentage was so high for this skill with the majority of the respondents from the survey falling in the Favorable range with the attitudinal scores.

The final area of interest in this study was what parents believe should be included in an elementary music education. The first section of the survey also helped to provide answers to this question. A few of the questions asked respondents if students should be graded in music, complete homework, take standardized tests, and be able to pass or fail music class. While 72% of the respondents strongly agreed that music is an important subject, only 61% agreed that it should be graded. Only 41% agreed that students should have homework from music, but 62% agreed that students should have to complete worksheets. According to these answers, it can be assumed that parents believe there should be some formal assessment used in music, but it should be done within the classroom. For the item asking whether or not students should have a standardized test to demonstrate their knowledge in music, 73% of the respondents agreed. This is interesting with current climate of high stakes testing and schools and teachers being held responsible for the results. There could be another study conducted to find out parents' attitudes towards high stakes testing and education in general to see if this a trend just in music or across all subjects.
In conclusion, participants who had positive experiences in their own music classes valued music higher than those who had negative experiences. Age did not factor into how participants valued music, but it did appear to influence their perception of what topics were covered in current music classes. Participants reported they had many performance opportunities in their music classes, but very little creation opportunities. Participants also held a high opinion of music and believed that student learning in music should be assessed within the confines of the classroom. From these findings, it is recommended that teachers and administrators should have open communication with parents within the school community. Parents should be informed of standards and expectations of the music classroom. This will help lessen the confusion when report cards are sent home about what their student had to accomplish in class. Teachers and administrators can host informal family nights, which allow the teachers to share the standards and answer questions from the parents. It is also recommended that music teachers send out newsletter periodically, maintain a class website, or use an accepted form of social media to keep parents informed of the various activities in the classroom. Building the relationship between the teacher and parents creates a bond of trust that will ensure a connection that both parties can utilize in the future and will strengthen the music program within the school and the community.
REFERENCES


